

Challenged Materials



Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 24, 1998	Videocassette: <i>The Ballad of Narayama</i>	The video is pornography (although it's based on fantasy). A man having sex with a dog is repulsive and pornography.	Reviews were generally very good. <i>Library Journal</i> called it a "sterling" example of modern Japanese cinema. This film was a Grand Prix winner at the Cannes Film Festival, 1983.	The videocassette <i>The Ballad of Narayama</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.
August 25, 1998	Book: <i>The Second Gates of Paradise: The Anthology of Short Erotic Fiction</i> by Alberto Manguel	Abnormal sexual fantasy which can be interpreted by minors as normal and therefore desirable. Some of the material has a pornographic, erotic tone.	<p>Pornographic material is usually designated as such by a legal review, through the courts, and would not usually be collected by a public library. An anthology of erotica is appealing to some public library users and not legally restricted.</p> <p>Alberto Manguel, who compiled the collection, is one of Canada's most brilliant and knowledgeable editors/anthologists. He is a consultant of the Banff Centre for the Arts and currently teaches at the University of Calgary. He has compiled numerous award-winning anthologies. His choice of authors in <i>The Second Gates</i> is representative of the best writers in the world – from Nobel prize winners to the brightest and the best in English and in translation. His thoughtful introductions to each story explain why it was chosen and what particular aspect of the erotic it represents.</p>	The book <i>The Second Gates of Paradise: The Anthology of Short Erotic Fiction</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 28, 1998	Book: <i>Good Families Don't</i> by Robert Munsch	I feel this book is in very bad taste. Many, many families do not allow their children to say the F word (“fart”) (in this book there are many a word the author could have used). Of course, everyone is entitled to buy the book of their choice (and rightly so) but for the library to carry the book is entirely different, as children can pick and read books in there without parental consent.	Reviews include one suggesting that, while the book can't be categorized as a masterpiece, it is a “real crowd pleaser” about a normally tasteless topic. Another review states that the book's style “lacks the usual Munschian punch”, but did not express concerns about the subject. The Library contains books for all reading tastes and that, for many customers, this book is not offensive. This is further evidenced by the fact that the book has gone into 12 printings since first being published.	The book <i>Good Families Don't</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.
October 28, 1998	Book: <i>Too Far Away to Touch</i> by Leslea Newman	<p>Story was not appropriate for young children and should be better categorized. Would not have borrowed the book if aware of the contents, but it is quite misleading and thought the book was about the stars. Unless you read it you are not aware of the contents. Since this book I have encountered numerous questions from my children regarding AIDS as well as why the two males are on such a friendly basis.</p> <p>My children are well informed about things but this was not an avenue I wished to discuss at this time with them.</p>	<p>The Library's Youth Services Team reviewed the book and recommended that the book be reclassified primarily because of the amount of text, as well as the sensitive nature of the subject matter.</p> <p>This book appeared to be a picture book for young children but, in fact, had more text and a more complicated story intended for older children. The content of the book is explicitly stated in the “blurb” on the inside cover of the jacket.</p>	The book <i>Too Far Away to Touch</i> will be reclassified from Easy Picture Books to Juvenile Fiction.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 28, 1998	Book: <i>Higgledy-Piggledy</i> by Myra Cohn and Peter Sis	The poetry is inappropriate for children as it teaches them the values of violence and nasty behaviour.	Reviews found about the book did not express serious concern about the points raised. One review described the content as “lighthearted venom”, and a second suggested that the book contained the kind of “black humor [that] will have some appeal for children...”, but also went on to suggest that its focus might be too narrow and monotonous. It is the opinion of the Youth Services Team that feelings of jealousy and ill-will are not uncommon among children, and the Library contains materials for all tastes, including those who enjoy black humor.	The book <i>Higgledy-Piggledy</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.
October 29, 1998	Book: <i>In die neue Welt: Wie die Europaer Nordamerika besiedelten</i> (<i>Into the New World, How the Europeans Settled North America</i>) by Raymond Cartier	Object to the continually derogatory tone and gross misrepresentation of facts, and historically irrelevant information.	The book belongs to the Multilingual Biblioservice (MBS) collection, a collection of books in languages other than English, which is deposited in libraries throughout Alberta.	The book <i>In die neue Welt: Wie die Europaer Nordamerika besiedelten</i> will be withdrawn from the Library’s shelves and returned to MBS with the customer’s comments.
October 29, 1998	Book: <i>Young Mutants</i> edited by Isaac Asimov, Martin Greenberg, and Charles Waugh	Object to the coarse language for its classification for 11-14 year olds.	This is a collection of science fiction short stories. Overall, the themes appear to be of an adolescent nature. The reviews recommend a junior or senior high readership.	The book <i>Young Mutants</i> will be reclassified from Juvenile to Young Adult.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 25, 1998	Book: <i>Revision of Justice</i> by John Morgan	Object to the homosexually graphic contents where the intent of the theme is to subvert morals and promote homosexual lifestyles. The plot is incidental.	<p>The book is second in a mystery series by John Morgan featuring a main character who is a gay, alcoholic reporter. The first novel in the series won a Mystery Writers of America Edgar award. Based on this, and the positive book reviews at the time of publication, the Library purchased this title.</p> <p>While it is recognized that some of the sexual encounters described are unpleasant and may offend some readers or make others uncomfortable, the same may be said about depictions of heterosexual scenes in numerous other novels. Readers may choose to stop reading a book because of this.</p> <p>Library collections serve a very diverse public whose individual interests, values and lifestyles differ enormously. The Library, therefore, does not select materials on the basis of whether or not an individual member of the public might approve or disapprove of the lifestyle reflected.</p>	The book <i>Revision of Justice</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 12, 1999	<p>Videocassette: <i>Hollywood Salutes Canadian Animation</i></p> <p>and</p> <p>Magazine: September issue of <i>Rolling Stone</i></p>	<p>It is adult subject matter, but when you read the video box there is nothing on it to suggest it is unsuitable for children (variety of themes like marital betrayal, stress/drug addition, dumping dead bodies, graphic nudity, beating people to death with boards, etc.)</p> <p>Totally nudity on front cover, in full view for kids, etc. on magazine display.</p>	<p>The video is found in the adult collections of the Library along with the “how-to” and nature/educational videos. The labeling on the video reflects the adult classification, and any other “blurbs” by the producing company would naturally have no indication of the suitability for children since the material is considered adult. While the adult collection may contain some items suitable for children, those items appear in the adult collection due to level of intellectual content or length. Videos suitable for children are classified as children’s materials. They do not appear on the same shelving as adult-use materials but rather in the children’s area of the Library. The labels on such items are clearly marked on their labels with an “E” (Easy) or a “J” (Juvenile).</p> <p>Your comments about <i>Rolling Stone</i> magazine also reflect your concern that children may see the material. <i>Rolling Stone</i> magazine is designed for adults and is displayed with other adult magazines. The September issue was not much different from other cover designs for this magazine published since its inception in the 1960s. The Library does make an effort to provide areas of the Library for children and families where the materials in which they would be interested are kept. We also provide areas for adults to read the most current magazines, which is where <i>Rolling Stone</i> magazine would be kept.</p>	<p>The videocassette <i>Hollywood Salutes Canadian Animation</i> will retain its current classification.</p> <p>The magazine <i>Rolling Stone</i> will continue to be displayed with other adult magazines.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 12, 1999	Book: <i>Pies</i> by Wilma Riley	Object to the behavior of the adults: feeding cow manure pie to a neighbor to get back at them.	<p>The book was originally located in the Easy Picture Book areas due both to the layout of the book and the beautiful illustrations by Canada’s award-winning illustrator Sheldon Cohen. However, upon closer look, we have determined that this story of revenge, remorse, friendship and the acceptance of differences is more appropriate, in terms of interest and reading levels, for older children. Similar books, such as Roch Carrier’s <i>The Hockey Sweater</i>, are catalogued Juvenile.</p> <p>One review suggested this book would be “useful in classroom discussion of strong emotions and ethnic tensions, but the scatological element may make adults uncomfortable”. In another review, it was “highly recommended for personal, school, or public library collections”.</p>	The book <i>Pies</i> will be reclassified from Easy Picture Books to Juvenile Fiction.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 12, 1999	<p>Book: <i>The Thief Who Couldn't Sleep: An Evan Tanner Mystery</i> by Lawrence Block, at the end of which the first chapter of <i>Tanner On Ice</i> appears as a preview</p>	Child sex acts.	<p>The concern expressed is about the chapter that appears at the end of <i>The Thief Who Couldn't Sleep</i> as a preview to advertise publication of <i>Tanner on Ice</i>. The novel is set in Bangkok, Burma and New York and it is correct that the first chapter includes a dialogue between a pimp and Evan Tanner (the main character) regarding the availability in Bangkok of child prostitutes. The pimp tries to get Tanner to be his customer. Tanner, however, refuses. Later, in the same chapter, Tanner has a conversation in a café about changes in the city, including the phenomenon of child prostitution and the tourist trade. While the picture drawn is grim, there is no detailed description other than passing comments as the conversation moves along.</p> <p>Reviewers of this novel have commented on its wry humor and wisecracks which are, in part, the result of having a character who suddenly finds himself in a world where 25 years have passed without his awareness. This creates an opportunity for the author to comment on the changes, as Block does with glee. The novel is not intended to titillate or shock. In its genre, it is a light, barely believable spoof with tongue-in-cheek ironies throughout. None of the reviewers expressed concerns about the first chapter.</p>	<p>The book <i>The Thief Who Couldn't Sleep: An Evan Tanner Mystery</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>The Thief Who Couldn't Sleep</i></p>		<p>As well, a review of the activity of this and other Lawrence Block books in the Edmonton Public Library collection indicate the popularity of this Edgar Award-winning author. The Library has some 35 Block titles in its collection.</p>	
<p>January 30, 1999</p>	<p>Book: <i>The Shopping Basket</i> by John Birmingham</p>	<p>The book is terrible. There is much violence – thumping, pushing, squashing.</p>	<p>Reviews of the book indicate that it was favorably received when it was published in 1980. As one reviewer wrote:</p> <p><i>“Though the resolution is left floating in the air, readers will have poured over details too good to miss. Big, colorful pictures make great fun of the bullying menagerie, while a pyramid layout design of the contents of the basket gives visual clues for each disappearing object. Detail, repetition, and comic vengeance make a story preschoolers will greatly enjoy.”</i></p> <p>While you expressed concern about the “thumping”, “pushing” and “squashing” that occurs in the book, this language is expressive of the different animals that Steven encounters. This title has circulated many times without prior complaint. Indeed, other readers have not found it offensive, but rather have found humor in Steven’s return from the store.</p>	<p>The book <i>The Shopping Basket</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 17, 1999	Book: <i>Matilda Who Told Such Dreadful Lies and was Burned to Death</i> by Hilaire Belloc	Morbid pictures and story.	<p>The story is, indeed, morbid. However, when considered within the context of the time in which it was written, one recognizes that it is a satire of the moralistic tales used in Edwardian England to promote proper behavior in children. Belloc was an historian, essayist and novelist and was considered one of the most versatile and prolific writers of his time. Among other things, he is noted for his books for children. In addition to works by Belloc, the Library has other materials of a similar nature in its collections (such as those by Roald Dahl) which do not appeal to everyone, but which have a place in the collection.</p> <p>Reviews of the book refer to the poem's "tongue-in-cheek humor" and describe it as "wickedly amusing, with illustrations to match". One review suggested that it has "story-time potential for tough-minded moralists", while another calls it "one of the author's least hyperbolic – and thus least successful – verses".</p>	The book <i>Matilda Who Told Such Dreadful Lies and was Burned to Death</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 29, 1999	Book: <i>Operation Morning Light: Terror in Our Skies; the True Story of Cosmos 954</i> by Leo Heaps	Strongly object to derogatory/defamatory racist statements about my mother, Marie Ruman. My mother died in 1992 and I had hoped these books would have been deleted by now. Instead this defamatory/racist material is my inheritance. I would like this book to be deleted. My mother was a kind, loving and trusting person: she tried but she had no way to exonerate herself from the defamatory comments and she suffered greatly. The crash of the (US) manned station receives news coverage annually and more in the future.	A decision has been made to remove this item from the Library's collection, although this is not a result of the challenge of the book. The following factors entered into the decision, made during the systematic weeding of collections at the Milner Library: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the Library already has an official history of the Cosmos 954 incident titled Voyage Into the Unknown; ▪ reviews question the accuracy and quality of the book; ▪ a copy of the book is held in the University of Library system, which should be sufficient for the region; and ▪ the Edmonton Public Library's copy is damaged and defaced. 	The book <i>Operation Morning Light: Terror in Our Skies; the True Story of Cosmos 954</i> will be removed from the Library's collection (although this is not a result of the challenge).

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 29, 1999	Videocassette: <i>Mario</i> a film by Jean Beaudin	Video should not be in the juvenile section. <i>Mario</i> captures the attention of the viewer through its woeness. The music prevails – a down sadness throughout. A suicide is the ending and everything reflects it. The boy’s stuffed fox has a scary spirit to it. The girlfriend takes off her shirt in a romantic ocean scene. Probably for a 14+ audience.	The reviewer agrees with the concern expressed and advises that the film deals with subjects more suitable for teens and adults owing to its subtlety and the themes it explores. Young viewers may end up bored or confused by the film rather than disturbed by its content. There are adult customers who would appreciate the film. Regarding the instance of nudity in the film, this is brief and implied. The character removes her shirt for a moment, but the viewer sees only her back. The reviewer found nothing objectionable in the scene and suggests that it was dealt with tastefully.	The videocassette <i>Mario</i> will be reclassified from Juvenile to Adult.
June 15, 1999	Picture puzzle book: <i>Look-Alikes</i> by Joan Steiner	Children’s book illustrates cigarettes, matches, grenade, and skeleton. The book is classified Easy and some material it contains is not suitable for children under the age of 8.	The reviewer suggested that while the book might be suitable for all ages, very young children may not be familiar with some of the objects. As well, <i>Look-Alikes</i> specifically deals with visual perception, a concept more suited to older children.	The book <i>Look-Alikes</i> will be reclassified from Easy to J 793.73 (Juvenile).

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
June 23, 1999	Library Booklist: <i>Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual and Transgendered Fiction</i>	Location of Library booklist.	<p>The Library provides booklists for both adults and children in subject areas where interest by our customers has been demonstrated. In this particular case, the booklist was produced to help customers who wish to find adult fiction which better reflects their lifestyle.</p> <p>Many Library branches display copies of this booklist in areas primarily used by adults within reach of those standing and in wheelchairs. The selection and display of library materials, Internet sites or booklists are not inhibited by the possibility that they come into the possession of children.</p>	The booklist <i>Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual and Transgendered Fiction</i> will remain on display in its current location in the Library.
December 22, 1999	CD: <i>Slim Shady LP</i> by Eminem	Language not proper for children to listen to.	Agree that the content of the CD is adult in nature. While it would not be recommended for young children, only a parent would be able to judge whether his/her teenager was mature enough to listen to it. The CD has a Parent Advisory Label indicating explicit content that has been placed on the cover by the record company. That being said, the CD is catalogued in the Library's adult CD collection. The many holds on this title indicate demand in the community for this CD.	The CD <i>Slim Shady LP</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 9, 2000	Book: <i>Little Grown-ups</i> by Tom Arma	The content depicts children in career clothing – biased and sexist (boys are plumber, farmer, chef, artist, diver, etc., while girls are either aerobics instructor or queen). Recommend material containing more options for females without sexist roles depicted.	<p>Although no reviews were found for this particular book, we did find ratings of other works by this author and all were positive. In addition, the Library has in its collections a number of titles by this author and no other complaints have been received about this or any of the other titles.</p> <p>Our in-house reviewer indicated that, from a literary point of view, this board book is very positive in that it contains photographs of babies and reflects a world that toddlers can relate to. That is, the babies are shown in full view in uncluttered settings with a variety of items that toddlers can identify. This is considered a precursor to reading.</p> <p>With regard to gender stereotyping, there are only three pictures in which gender is indicated – policewoman, businessman, and queen. In all of the remaining photos the subjects are similarly dressed babies and there is no indication of gender. Consequently, it is difficult to label them as gender-specific. Indeed, it would seem that the photo of the “policewoman” depicts what was once a non-traditional role for women. As well, the roles that are identified in the book would have to be relayed to the toddler by the accompanying caregiver.</p>	The book <i>Little Grown-ups</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 24, 2000	Book: <i>Cutting and Styling</i>	Title is out of date.	The Library has decided to remove this title from its collection as it has many newer titles on this subject.	The book <i>Cutting and Styling</i> will be removed from the Library's collection.
November 24, 2000	Book: <i>Mummy Laid an Egg!</i> by Babette Cole	Illustrations of mommies and daddies having sex in different positions. This book was in the children's section – definitely inappropriate for this age group.	<p>In the course of their work, reviews of the book by both librarians and parents were consulted from various sources, including print reviews in review journals, as well as reviews by parents on Internet sites. The bulk of the reviews are favorable, pointing to the humor of the situation in which the parents find themselves.</p> <p>Books which deal with reproduction are often the subject of valid concern for parents like yourself. Parents are concerned that children receive not only correct information, but also information presented according to their wishes and beliefs. However, there are as many ideas about what constitutes appropriate information for children as there are families. The book itself is classified as Juvenile Non-fiction because of the reading level and is placed in the collection for the use of children who can read independently or for parents to read and discuss with their children.</p>	The book <i>Mummy Laid an Egg!</i> will be retained in the Library's juvenile collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 28, 2000	Videocassette: <i>The Tale of Peter Rabbit and Benjamin Bunny</i> , based on the book by Beatrix Potter	The behavior depicted in the video is inappropriate for viewing by children. Specifically, an older male rabbit grabbing and shaking two smaller bunnies by their ears and then spanking them with a stick. Please consider removing the video from your collection.	<p>Beatrix Potter – today considered a classic children’s author – wrote <i>The Tale of Benjamin Bunny</i> in 1904. At nearly 100 years old, the book should be read and considered within its historical context – a period when corporeal punishment was far more acceptable than it is today. The video is true to the original story and, as a large urban public library, it is Edmonton Public Library’s responsibility to represent a broad range of works, including those of Beatrix Potter in their entirety.</p> <p>The video has received a three-star rating in the <i>New York Times Guide to the Best Children’s Videos</i> (three stars constitute an “all-star” rating, which indicates an item has received the highest ratings by both adult and child jurors). The guide was written in collaboration with the Coalition for Quality Children’s Media which states that its mission is “to enhance children’s viewing experiences by making quality children’s media more visible and more readily available”.</p>	The videocassette <i>The Tale of Peter Rabbit and Benjamin Bunny</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 28, 2000	Book: <i>Mind Riot: Coming of Age in Comix</i> , edited by Karen D. Hirsch	Object to pg. 67: “Animal urges” and pg. 100 “Three sisters”. This book and other “alternative” comics (i.e. adult) should be in the adult section of the Library.	<p>The book is intended as a coming of age book, but is written in a comic book format. Increasingly, books are being published on a variety of subjects (e.g. biographies) in a comic book format. Similarly, a number of titles focusing on “coming of age” have cartoon illustrations. These types of materials are being catalogued according to their subject content first and format second.</p> <p>The book in question contains subject matter intended for a teenage audience. Journal reviews, including one in <i>School Library Journal</i>, have recommended this title for teen audiences.</p>	The book <i>Mind Riot: Coming of Age in Comix</i> will remain classified as “Juvenile”, owing to its intended audience, but will be reclassified from the comic section (J 741.5973) to the section of the collection focusing on dating, sex, body changes, and self image (J 305).

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 18, 2000	Book: <i>I Never Knew Your Name</i> by Sherry Garland	<p>The book is not appropriate for youngsters – a boy leaps off the roof and commits suicide.</p> <p>This can be a useful resource if a child in a family or school has committed suicide. However, this book needs to be read under the guidance of an adult so these complex issues and emotions can be discussed (values, morals, beliefs).</p>	<p>The book, which is in a picture book format, is currently catalogued as Juvenile Fiction. The Library’s collection contains many books which, while they appear to be picture books, have a more complicated story or sensitive subject matter and are intended for older children. These are often categorized as “Picture Books for All Ages”.</p> <p>Library reviewers agreed that the subject of the book was suitable for discussion as the story is tragic. However, reviews of this book indicate that it is recommended for children in grade 4 and up. As well, it is told from a child’s point of view and intended to have a shock value.</p> <p>Were the book to be integrated into the adult fiction collection it would become inaccessible by its target audience. This thought provoking book teaches a valuable lesson about the importance of friendship and reaching out to others and can be used in discussions with children about these issues and that of suicide.</p>	The book <i>I Never Knew Your Name</i> will remain in the Library’s Juvenile Fiction collection, but will be relocated to the “Picture Books for all Ages” section.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 3, 2001	Magazines: <i>Vue Weekly</i> and <i>See Magazine</i>	Each of these weeklies, distributed in or adjacent to our libraries, has a column that deals very explicitly with matters of human sexuality by responding to the queries of readers. Much of the content is vulgar, perverted and contrary to the inculcation of healthy attitudes about human reproduction in the minds of juvenile Edmontonians who now have easy access to these newspapers.	<p><i>Vue Weekly</i> and <i>See Magazine</i> are, like many other community publications, distributed in all of our libraries as part of our mission to connect the people of Edmonton to the knowledge and culture of the world. The information in those magazines, particularly that of a local nature, meets the informational and recreational needs of many of our customers.</p> <p>Publications such as these are widely available throughout our community, in locations ranging from grocery stores to libraries. The Library is an important participant in the distribution of community information resources such as these publications.</p> <p>While it is agreed that some of the content of the publications is controversial, the Library recognizes there are those who support the content as well as those who disagree with it.</p> <p>The Library does not include the publications within its children's sections, although children have access to all parts of our collections and resources.</p>	The publications <i>Vue Weekly</i> and <i>See Magazine</i> will continue to be available in the Information Services Division of the Library.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 29, 2001	Book: <i>Fortress North</i> by Ella Jacoby Walker	The classification of the book.	The book is classified at the Library as a work of fiction and is identified by the author as a novel in her “Acknowledgement”. While it many contain historically accurate information, it is not the role of the public library to evaluate the accuracy of any information it may contain.	The book <i>Fortress North</i> will continue to be classified as Fiction.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 30, 2001	Book: <i>The Raging Quiet</i> by Sherryl Jordan	<p>The book is tedious, soft-core pornographic trash and does not belong on a list of recommended books like YRCA. It is unsuitable for any student and would only belong with trashy Harlequins for adults.</p> <p>Request that EPL:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Quit Young Readers' Choice Award in protest of the inclusion of this title; ▪ Institute a Canadian young readers' choice award program; ▪ Put up signs in all branches saying that EPL does not approve of, or recommend, <i>The Raging Quiet</i>; ▪ Move the book to the romance section. 	<p><i>The Raging Quiet</i> received excellent reviews from all consulted sources, most of which indicated that it was suitable for those aged 12 and up. It was a <i>School Library Journal</i> and a <i>Publisher's Weekly</i> "starred book", which means it was included in their lists of best books of 1999.</p> <p>The Senior Division list for the Young Readers' Choice Award was created for high school students to participate in the award, and to provide a place for young adult books that are intended for more mature readers. It is reasonable that not everyone will like all the books on the list, as tastes vary as much as people, but the Senior Division includes a wide variety of books.</p> <p>In response to specific suggestions made, the Library does not mark items to show approval or disapproval of their contents. As well, the Library is satisfied that <i>The Raging Quiet</i> is a "well reviewed" book which should be included in the collection and that the Library should continue to participate in the Young Readers' Choice Awards.</p>	<p>The book <i>The Raging Quiet</i> will retain its Young Adult classification, and the Library will continue to participate in YRCA.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 18, 2002	Book: <i>What's the Big Secret?</i> by Laurene Krasny Brown	Object to the availability of the book and lack of discretion. The book is unacceptable, sexually explicit, and lacking in discretion. Suggest the book not be made generally available on the shelves where children are able to access it.	<p>The book has received excellent reviews from major reviewing journals, including <i>Horn Book</i>, one of the most highly reputed review sources for children's books. The <i>Horn Book</i> reviewer indicated that the authors have "tackled this most difficult subject with a healthy mix of sensitivity and humor".</p> <p>The Library has a range of children's materials dealing with human sexuality. It reflects a range of approaches to sex instruction, including sex instruction from a Christian point of view. The Library recognizes that parents will have differing viewpoints about sex instruction for their children, and strives to provide a balanced collection with a range of approaches.</p>	The book <i>What's the Big Secret?</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 18, 2002	Book: <i>Diana Thorneycroft: the Body, Its Lesson and Camouflage</i>	The photographs are pornographic in an essentially dark, destructive way without being sexual or erotic or appealing in any way.	<p>The artist, Diana Thorneycroft, has been described as “Canada’s most controversial artist”, and has achieved an international reputation. Reviews and articles indicate that her work incites debate, and that while some viewers find it offensive, others find it brilliant. Her exhibitions often create controversy and spark discussion about the nature of artistic expression.</p> <p>While the Library recognizes that Thorneycroft’s work is not to everyone’s taste, the photographic works have not been categorized as obscene or pornographic under the Criminal Code. While the Library does not include illegal works in its collection, it is the policy of the Library to maintain a collection representing a wide range of views and expression and to allow customers the opportunity to decide what they should or should not read or view.</p> <p>Our Arts and Literature Librarian has said the following about the book: “If we are to reflect current thinking about art in Canada, we should keep the book on the basis of the public discussion generated by the artist’s work...For people to be able to have an informed opinion about the work they need to be able to see some examples of it.”</p>	The book <i>Diana Thorneycroft: the Body, Its Lesson and Camouflage</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 4, 2002	<i>Body of work</i> by David Irving	Customer objects to the body of work by this author because he feels the Library is supplying “history” books that are suspect in terms of scholarship and that the author is well-known for his politically-incorrect interpretations of events in Europe during the Second World War. Customer describes Mr. Irving as an anti-Semite and Holocaust denier and indicates that his books have no place on the shelves of the Edmonton Public Library.	<p>In the Library’s investigation of the books by David Irving, it found reviews in reliable publications that note that he not a “convincing scholar” and which point to errors and standard mistakes. Nevertheless, he is a qualified historian. His works have been reviewed in magazines such as “Time” and he is a popular and much requested author. While Mr. Irving’s books may be controversial, they are legally distributed in Canada and are included in most Alberta public library collections, as well as at the University of Alberta.</p> <p>As part of the Library’s commitment to intellectual freedom, its collection includes many works with which not everyone agrees and which are controversial. Balancing off the works by Mr. Irving, the Library’s collection includes many books written by Holocaust survivors, as well as people who experienced Nazi Germany prior to and during the Second World War. The books by Mr. Irving contained in the Library’s collection support healthy debate.</p>	The works of David Irving will be retained in the Library’s collections.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 4, 2002	(continued from previous page) Body of work by David Irving		Having a wide range of materials on a subject is part of a free and democratic society and the Library recognizes that people have many reasons for reading such materials, including the desire to learn more about the different viewpoints in this debate. It is necessary for those who wish to understand the issue and engage in intellectual rebuttal to have access to materials like this, despite the fact that the content may be perceived as odious by some and as truth by others.	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July, 2002	Book: <i>Mummy Laid an Egg!</i> by Babette Cole	Object to page which reads: "Here are some ways mummies and daddies fit together", and illustrates sexual positions. The rest of the book was fun and descriptive of how babies are made, but we don't need to go so far as to give children positions. Would recommend the book for no age groups, however, recommend age 3 and up for the book without the pages referred to above.	<p>In the course of their work, reviews of the book by both librarians and parents were consulted from various sources, including print reviews in review journals, as well as reviews by parents on Internet sites. The bulk of the reviews are favorable, pointing to the humor of the situation in which the parents find themselves.</p> <p>Books which deal with reproduction are often the subject of valid concern for parents. Parents are concerned that children receive not only correct information, but also information presented according to their wishes and beliefs. However, there are as many ideas about what constitutes appropriate information for children as there are families. The book itself is classified as Juvenile Non-fiction because of the reading level and is placed in the collection for the use of children who can read independently or for parents to read and discuss with their children.</p>	The book <i>Mummy Laid an Egg!</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 11, 2002	Book: <i>The Pink Swastika</i> by Scott Lively	Object to pseudo-historical claims – “propaganda”. The theme of this material is to make people negative towards gay people. Wants book removed from the Library’s collection.	Staff searched for reviews and other information on this title and have no evidence that the title has been banned or classified as hate literature by any organization. In fact, the title is held by many other public libraries, both in western Canada and the U.S. As objectionable or offensive as the thesis of the book may be to some, it does represent a point of view on a particular historical issue. The author drew heavily on the works of mainstream writers and historians for the source material, and while his interpretation may be “politically incorrect”, the Library’s role is to support intellectual freedom by collecting materials representing many points of view.	The book <i>The Pink Swastika</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.
September 12, 2002	Book: <i>Children of the Matrix: How an Interdimensional Race Has Controlled the World for Thousands of Years – and Still Does</i> by David Icke	Complainant, who is a lawyer, claims that the book libels him, the Canadian Jewish Congress, and another man, Bernie Farber, by accusing them of helping to cover up child murder, child torture, Satanic sacrifice and similar activities. The theme of the book is conspiratorial and anti-semitic. Requests removal of material from collection, and will proceed with formal libel action against the Library if book is not removed.	The Library is seeking legal advice.	Until such time as the results of the pending libel action has been determined, the Library will not withdraw this title from circulation. (As of March 2008, no libel action has been taken by the complainant.)

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 19, 2002	Book: <i>Pinkerton, Behave!</i>	<p>Disappointed that a book illustrating a man holding a gun to a woman's head (after breaking into her house) and him making a comment about "blasting her to chicken powder" would be in the book section for young children 3-6 years old.</p> <p>Would like to see the book off the shelf for young children, and moved to pre-teen.</p>	<p>The bulk of the reviews of the book are favorable, pointing to the humor of the situation in which the dog is unable to behave properly at training school, but when his family is in danger he comes through with flying colors.</p> <p>Books for children are selected by a group of children's special librarians based on the needs of the community and reviews of the material. Classification is based on the reading level of the text within the book. Parents are advised to monitor the items which their children borrow or which they borrow to read with their children. The Library's serves a community with diverse interests, tastes and beliefs and consequently leaves the very personal matter of choice up to parents.</p>	The book <i>Pinkerton, Behave!</i> will be retained in the Library's E collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 4, 2003	Book: <i>Jonah and the Whale and Other Stories</i>	<p>The complainant’s 6-year-old daughter borrowed the book from the Children’s Division. The child asked the parent, “Do you know that Jews don’t believe in God?” This was from the sentence in the story “Esther the Beautiful” which reads “The King of Babylon did not believe in God like the Jews, but many Jewish people lived in his land.” The customer feels that this sentence is anti-Semitic or at least poorly written because it is ambiguous.</p> <p>She also felt the story “God’s Calm Voice” promotes militarism and violence in that Elijah is told to kill the bad people with God’s help. She says that this book turns Bible stories into action stories in which fighting and killing are endorsed by God.</p> <p>She feels that this book should be removed from the Library, or at the very least vetted by a Christian organization.</p>	<p>The language of the book is rather stilted, which can happen when an author attempts to simplify and paraphrase for a young audience. In the story, “Esther the Beautiful,” the word “did” is implied (“The Kind of Babylon did not believe in God like the Jews [did]”). While some readers may not catch the implication, the wording is at worst confusing, rather than anti-Semitic. The story “God’s Calm Voice,” though much simplified, is substantially the same as that in the Old Testament.</p> <p>In keeping with its adherence to the Statement of Intellectual Freedom and its commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying points of view, the Library will retain “Jonah and the Whale and Other Stories” in its collection.</p>	The book <i>Jonah and the Whale and Other Stories</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 11, 2003	Video: <i>Lonely Planet</i> travel video for Amsterdam	Objects to the video's inappropriate content, specifically, the video's promotion of nudity, gay/lesbian touring and where to access pot.	<p>The Lonely Planet series of travel videos are considered to be good introductions to different aspects of a region's culture and often take time to explore alternative lifestyles. The Lonely Planet travel videos are regularly featured on cable TV stations.</p> <p>The video's back jacket refers to Amsterdam as "one of the most radical cities in Europe" and internationally the city has a reputation for its cultural permissiveness. The video cover notes that the viewers will "attend a mass gay wedding" as well as see works of art and activity from the Albert Cuyp market.</p> <p>Several staff members reviewed the film's content and found that its focus was in line with the Lonely Planet's emphasis on cultural diversity and some of the concerns of a younger audience. When videos are selected for the library, we endeavor to find material which will serve as a document to our times, representing different points of view.</p>	The video <i>Lonely Planet</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 27, 2004	Magazine: <i>Maxim</i>	<p>Objects to the Woodcroft Branch holding this magazine, which he feels is a “clone of the stereotypical men’s publication which you can find prominently displayed at the checkout counters of all Mac’s convenience stores. <i>Maxim</i> copies the successful business model of Playboy and Hustler, which elevates women to the status of brain dead sexual objects.”</p>	<p>ELP serves a large and diverse community. In doing so, it serves as a venue for ideas aimed at satisfying the interests and needs of individuals of varied backgrounds and differing beliefs. Consequently, in keeping with its Statement on Intellectual Freedom and Censorship, it is the policy of the Edmonton Public Library to maintain a collection representing a wide range of views and expression, and to enable all customers the opportunity to decide individually what they should or should not read.</p> <p>In fulfilling this mandate, the Woodcroft Branch subscribes to <i>Maxim</i>, a very popular, well-circulating men’s magazine which is legally available to citizens whether at convenience stores or at the local branch of the public library. However, in addition to this magazine, it is essential to recognize that Woodcroft’s adult magazine collection represents a broad range of opinions and interests. The collection also includes: Scientific American, Vogue, Discover, Astronomy, Mother Earth News, People, New Yorker, Today’s Parent, Wired, and Walrus. Clearly, the preceding list of adult magazines illustrates Woodcroft’s intent to provide a wide variety of materials that satisfy the diverse needs and interests of the citizens of Edmonton.</p>	<p>The magazine <i>Maxim</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 4, 2004	Book: <i>Panic Snap</i> by Laura Reese	<p>I'm a big fan of mysteries, fiction and non-fiction. Non-fiction brings home how people are led to acts of violence against other people or their property. Not necessarily "led". I find forensic sciences fascinating. I have always felt I've had an open mind to any number of subjects.</p> <p>The Novel <i>Panic Snap</i> began, and ended, quite "innocently". The first bit certainly was a good intro and caught my attention. However, the relationship between the characters was beyond my imagination. It was frightening in the sense that the material was too life like. I had no difficulty imagining someone with a bad attitude towards the opposite sex finding ideas of how to degrade and hurt other people. It scared me that anyone could have access to this material – including the very young. The personalities were gross/sick/depraved.</p> <p>Never have I felt so strongly about a book being removed from the library.</p>	<p>Reviews of the book identify it as a "taut, suspenseful thriller", while recognizing that the topic of sexual obsession will not be to all readers' taste. While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this book, we are aware that other readers will have different reactions to the content and approach.</p> <p>You have expressed additional concern regarding the access that young people may have to this book. The policy of the Edmonton Public Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view and listen to.</p>	The book <i>Panic Snap</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
May 14, 2004	Book: <i>Fever Cell</i> by Leonard Goldberg	The novel appears to me to be hate propaganda directed against Muslim and Arabic people of and from the Middle East. In addition to them being the “villains” (a bearable device in this spy-genre), they are characterized as heartless, referred to in a very biased manner and thus de-humanized.	<p>The story focuses on plot rather than characterization and, as is typical of this genre (mainstream, medical suspense/spy fiction), there are “good guys” who are pursued by the “bad guys”. While the villains in <i>Fever Cell</i> are terrorists who are characterized as cruel and vengeful toward Jews and Christians, the author separates them from ordinary Arabic people by noting the prejudice that Arabic people in the United States have had to face since 9/11.</p> <p>By way of example, when Mr. Anderson, a philanthropist, wants to ensure that no person from the Middle East is appointed to the endowed position he is about to establish at the hospital, Murdock states: <i>“Surely, Mr. Anderson, you realize that there are some very fine Americans whose ancestors came from the Middle East. It’s really not fair --”</i></p> <p>And elsewhere: <i>Jake knew the Arabic community in America was closely knit. Most had a fear of outsiders in general and law enforcement in particular. Whenever there was an act of terror, they felt they were always the one unjustly singled out and presumed guilty.</i></p>	The book <i>Fever Cell</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Fever Cell</i></p>		<p>This last item on unfair treatment and racial profiling is reiterated elsewhere in the book. As well, we learn late in the book that a character who Jake has suspected to be a terrorist is really one of the “good guys”.</p> <p>The foregoing suggests that the book itself does not condone racism or hatred, but does make use of stereotypes as an instrument for developing a storyline that will grip the reader. While the Arab terrorists in <i>Fever Cell</i> are distinguished as cruel, inhumane people lacking any redeeming qualities, the author does acknowledge the suffering and prejudice faced by everyday Arabs and those of Arab origin living in America.</p>	
June 4, 2004	<p>Book: <i>The Cunning Little Vixen</i> by Rudolf Tesnohlidek, with illustrations by Maurice Sendak</p>	<p>Object to book being catalogued as a children’s book. Specific innuendo and swearing (blasphemy); alluded violence, perhaps not suitable language and content for children.</p>	<p>The fact that the book is illustrated by Maurice Sendak, an award-winning author and illustrator of children’s books, may explain why it was catalogued as a children’s book. The reviews found treated it as an adult book and a check of the holdings of several other major Canadian public libraries revealed that most have included it in their adult collections.</p> <p>While the book has merit, it is better suited to the adult collection.</p>	<p>The book <i>The Cunning Little Vixen</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection but will be reclassified and placed in the adult collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 15, 2004	Book: <i>Pills-A-Go-Go</i> by Jim Hogshire	<p>It is written in a strange caustic manner and in it I found:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How to write fake prescriptions • How to break into pharmacies • How to make fake valium • How to get pure codeine out of Tylenol with Codeine (how to separate it out) <p>I guess the authors had real people writing in their expert advice. It also mentioned methamphetamine. Not to be theatrical, but if they had listed the actual steps and ingredients in making this (as they did the others) I would have held the book out of the library and talked to the police.</p> <p>This seems like some kind of an “underground” book and I know you will realize that it cannot possibly stay on the shelves.</p>	<p>While disturbing, the description of these activities serves to provide instruction on matters of drug use (and specifically pill use), on our culture, and describes the lengths to which people will go to satisfy their needs for these substances. It is also believed that the methods described in <i>Pills-A-Go-Go</i> to create or extract drugs would be too complex for the average reader to undertake and therefore individuals would be unlikely to carry out such procedures after reading this book.</p> <p>The Librarian who reviewed the book found that <i>Pills-A-Go-Go</i> contains other valuable elements that recommend it for continued inclusion in the Library’s collection. The book includes a unique collection of historical prescription drug advertisements not easily found elsewhere. It provides an interesting description of the marketing techniques of pharmaceutical companies and presents readers with a frank description of how prescription drugs are being abused. Finally, the book presents a bibliography of sources that includes respected medical and scientific research journals and patent documents that could be of use for further research into drug and pill culture.</p>	The book <i>Pills-A-Go-Go</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	(continued from previous page) <i>Pills-A-Go-Go</i>		The public library collections exist to represent the varied educational and recreational needs of our diverse society. While the Library recognizes that Jim Hogshire's book is not to everyone's taste, there are no legal grounds for excluding the book from the collection.	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 30, 2004	<i>Boy O Boy</i> by Brian Doyle	Describes a homosexual seducing young boy.	<p>Reviews of the book have appeared in highly reputable review journals for children’s literature, including School Library Journal, Horn Book, and Quill and Quire. The reviews have been unanimous in their praise for the book. While recognizing that the book deals with some difficult subject content, including sexual abuse, reviewers have praised Brian Doyle’s work as “a novel of infinite depth” that handles describing molestation in a style that is “devastating in [its] minimalism”.</p> <p><i>Boy O Boy</i> was awarded the 2004 Canadian Library Association Book of the Year for Children Award as well as the Ruth Schwartz Children’s Book Award given out by the Ontario Arts Council. In addition, Brian Doyle is an internationally respected author who is the recipient of the prestigious Hans Christian Andersen Award, an international award given by the International Board on Books for Young People (IBBY) to a living author whose “complete works have made a lasting contribution to the world of children’s literature.”</p>	The book <i>Boy O Boy</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
May 31, 2005	Magazine: <i>Maxim for Men</i>	<p>The cover is a problem – not appropriate. Cover it up or remove the material. I am told “it’s very popular and we don’t want to censor”. I’m sure Playboy is popular too but someone in your organization censoring that. As for Maxim Magazine specifically, even the 7-11 stores have the good sense to cover up the cover in their stores so you only see the titles. Children at 7-11 are protected from in-your-face images of scantily clad women.</p>	<p>The Strathcona Branch and other Library branches subscribe to Maxim for Men, a very popular, well-circulating men’s magazine. In addition to this magazine, it is essential to recognize that Strathcona’s adult magazine collection represents a broad range of opinions and interests and also includes: <i>Scientific American, Discover, Popular Science, Harper’s, Utne, Natural Health, Parents, and Walrus</i>. Clearly, the preceding list of adult magazines illustrates Strathcona’s intent to provide a wide variety of materials that satisfy the diverse needs and interests of the citizens of Edmonton. While some ideas may be unpopular or unconventional, it is the Library’s role to provide a collection of materials that represents the widest range of views and expressions.</p> <p>It is important to note that this magazine is shelved with the Adult Magazine and newspaper collection at STR. STR has a separate magazine collection for children in the children’s area. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what they read...</p>	<p>The Library will retain <i>Maxim for Men</i> in its collection without obscuring its cover.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 22, 2006	Book: <i>Jokes Men Only Tell Other Men</i> , volume 3 of <i>Yuk Yuk's Joke Books</i>	Object to making disadvantaged social groups or specific segments of society an object of derisory humour for gratuitous purposes.	<p>While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this book, we are aware that other readers will have different reactions to the content. Of all types of literature, responses to humor are especially subjective. We recognize that no one book of humor will appeal to all readers, and that what some find humorous others will find stupid or distasteful.</p> <p>In keeping with the Library's adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and its commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the book <i>Jokes Men Only Tell Other Men</i> will be retained in the Library's collections. The book is catalogued as an adult book and as such every adult has the right to make his or her own decision with regard to choice of reading material.</p>	The book <i>Jokes Men Only Tell Other Men</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 15, 2006	Book: <i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i> by Allen Morgan	A stranger comes to a little boy's bedroom window in the middle of the night, asks the boy to accompany him; the boy does because it "sounds like fun".	<p><i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i> is a children's picture book written by Canadian author Allen Morgan and illustrated by Canadian Michael Martchenko. Published in 1998 by Stoddart Kids Press, it is one of a popular series of titles known as the <i>Matthew's Midnight Adventure Series</i>.</p> <p>The stories all revolve around the fun and fast-paced fantasy adventures of a little boy who wakes at midnight and then goes on all sorts of wild adventures. The first title, <i>Matthew and the Midnight Tow Truck</i>, was published in 1984 and is still in print. It is listed in <i>A Guide to Canadian Children's Books</i>, a resource guide which was compiled by two respected experts in the field of Canadian children's literature, Diedre Baker and Ken Settrington. In the introduction to their book, the authors say that "high literary quality has been the determining feature in our first round of selection". In this title, as in subsequent titles in the series, Matthew wakes in the night and is invited by someone, in this case a tow truck driver, to join him on an adventure. Baker and Settrington describe it this way:</p>	The book <i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i> will be retained in the Library's collections and will continue to be housed in the picture book Easy collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i></p>		<p><i>After playing with his cars and having a dessert that is not the red licorice he truly desires, Matthew goes to bed. He wakes at midnight to see a huge tow truck in front of the house; when he investigates, the midnight tow truck driver invites him to come and help.In the morning Matthew wakes with a toy van in his pocket, very much like the big van he helped the driver hook. ...Subsequent titles by the same team repeat the grandiose formula and include Matthew and the Midnight Money Van, Matthew and the Midnight Turkeys, a compendium entitled Matthew's Midnight Adventures and more.</i></p> <p>In the rest of the titles in the series, the same kinds of events happen. Matthew wakes in the night and then joins someone on an adventure related to that person's occupation. These include pirates, firefighters, wrestlers, wreckers, pilots and even turkeys. Reviews of other titles in the series describe the books as follows:</p> <p><i>These whimsical and droll stories appeal to kids' humour and the love of the unexpected. The full color cartoon style illustrations perfectly match the playful spirit of the wacky stories.</i></p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 15, 2006	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i></p>		<p><i>...This volume is an excellent value for libraries wishing to refurbish their "Matthew" collections, and it will introduce a new generation of kids to these enjoyable stories. Highly Recommended (Canadian Materials, January 4, 2002)</i></p> <p><i>Matthew's midnight adventures are fast becoming a popular series, and, while the book is a bit zany at times, it is bound to appeal to kids with active imaginations who long for adventure and excitement in everyday life. (Canadian Materials, December 15, 2000)</i></p> <p>Checks of other large Canadian public libraries found multiple copies of the title in all of them. The collections checked were Vancouver Public Library, Calgary Public Library, Saskatoon Public Library, Winnipeg Public Library, Hamilton Public Library and Toronto Public Library.</p> <p><i>Matthew and the Midnight Flood</i> is a fantasy adventure, as are many children's books. Fantasy is an important element in children's lives and this is often reflected in the literature for them.</p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 10, 2006	Book: <i>Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs</i> by Frank Asch	<p>Object to last two pages of story: "...he blew the tiny raft far out to sea." Also, "...they all went for a swim."</p> <p>I don't know what the author was hoping children would learn from the actions of the pig named Ziggy. Yes, he was creative and perhaps a free spirit. However, he may have delivered his friends into greater danger. What is the lesson learned?</p> <p>Would recommend this material for mature students of literature or children who would critique it to discover whether it would be suitable for publishing or reading to/by younger children.</p>	<p><i>Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs</i> is a children's picture book written by popular author and illustrator Frank Asch. It was published by Kids Can Press in 1998. The story is what is known as a "fractured fairy tale" version of the traditional three little pigs story. In this version, there is a fourth little pig named Ziggy who is a fun-loving pig who doesn't live in any sort of a house but rather sleeps outside under the stars.</p> <p>Frank Asch is an award-winning author of a great many books for children. The Edmonton Public Library has 24 listings for Frank Asch, including books that have been translated into French and books on CD and cassette. <i>Something about the Author</i> describes his books this way, "Asch, whose picture books feature simple, humorous texts and illustrations, deals with themes ranging from self-discovery to fear, love, peace, imagination, and nature."</p> <p>You have indicated that you object to the last two pages of story which state that: "he blew the tiny raft far out to sea" and that "...they all went for a swim..." As one review of the book states: "Traditionally, the story of the Three Little Pigs is about the triumph of industriousness and diligence.</p>	The book <i>Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs</i> will be retained in the Library's collections and will continue to be housed in the picture book collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs</i></p>		<p>But in this update, the hero is a nonconformist pig number four named Ziggy, who sleeps under the stars and prefers the beach to being locked safely indoors.” Another states that the book puts:</p> <p><i>“another spin on summertime industry in preparation for winter. Asch’s Ziggy reminds us to lighten up and enjoy the sunny days. His bright blue skies and fluffy clouds reinforce the message, and the cozy cartoon pigs and not-too-frightening wolf (in fuchsia tank top) makes this a good choice for giving young audiences their first dose of ironic humor.”</i></p> <p>Still another review notes that Ziggy’s “resourcefulness takes the Wolf by surprise and saves the day”. Overall, the book was favourably recommended in several standard reviewing journals including <i>Booklist</i> and <i>Horn Book Magazine</i> for children in the range of 3 – 7 years of age.</p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 18, 2006	Graphic novel: <i>Green Arrow: Quiver</i> By Kevin Smith	Graphic depiction/description of violent child abuse. The book is very well written and entertaining and clever. It is just the ending, with a villain that is a demon worshipping Satanist that kidnaps, tortures and murders children – it crosses the line. Recommend reclassifying to 18+, if kept at all.	<p>Reviews in three reviewing sources of graphic novel fiction give <i>Green Arrow: Quiver</i> positive reviews, indicating that the storyline and artwork to be clever and engaging. The American Library Association also included the Kevin Smith’s Green Arrow titles in its “Best Books for Young Adults” list. These features, as well as Kevin Smith’s popularity with teens, indicate that this title may be appropriately placed in a Young Adult collection.</p> <p>Having noted the positive nature of the reviews, the same reviews indicated a need for a “mild mature reader’s caution” as well as an audience of “general adult”. The title has a definite appeal to a young adult audience but the depiction of mature issues such as child abuse makes it more appropriate for older readers.</p>	The graphic novel <i>Green Arrow: Quiver</i> will be reclassified as adult fiction.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 19, 2006	DVD: <i>Betty Blue</i>	<p>R rated movies should be available for rental by adults only. Any child could take this off the shelf, <u>without parental consent</u>, and borrow it and view it <u>without parental consent</u>. Children are restricted from movie theatres showing such material. Why does the publicly funded library make such movies available to children?</p>	<p>The film <i>Betty Blue</i>, directed by Jean-Jacques Beineix, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources and had been nominated for, and won, several awards when it was released in 1986. It was nominated as Best Foreign Language Film for an Academy Award (Oscar), the Golden Globes, and for the British Academy Film and Television Arts Award in 1987. It was the winner in the Best Foreign Film category at the Montreal World Film Festival and the Boston Society of Film Critics Awards.</p> <p>You express concern that this film is "R-rated" and that "any child could take [it] off the shelf without parental consent". With regard to rating, while you describe the film as "R-rated", the movie held by the Library is labeled as an "Unrated Director's Cut". This means that it appears as edited by the Director and has not been rated. A search of films rated by the Alberta Film Classification Service failed to turn up an official rating for <i>Betty Blue</i>.</p>	<p>The DVD will be retained in the Library's collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 19, 2006	DVD: <i>Western Canada by RV</i>	<p>The information is inaccurate or outdated and it presents a very negative and incorrect view of Canada. The DVD is produced by Americans for Americans in 2000. If a person watched this DVD and believed everything in this DVD you would think Canada had no cities, phones, roads, etc. This DVD is the ultimate in ignoramus americanus propaganda.</p> <p>The authors/stars of this DVD also rename all of our roads/highways, giving them American names. The stars of the DVD express extreme concern about possible lack of telephone and Internet in Canada. They say the only place they can get phone service is at one campground at a landline and Internet at a post office/Internet café. They are very careful to make sure there are no buildings or cities shown, with the exception of Vancouver and Victoria.</p>	<p>One of our collections experts has viewed the DVD and was unable to substantiate your claims. The DVD documents the journey of the show's hosts in their RV through the scenic wonders of Alberta and British Columbia, their stay in provincial and private campgrounds, and their impressions of Western Canada. Our reviewer did not hear any negative comments about Canada and noted that the adjectives most often used in the narration describe Canada as "beautiful", "wonderful", "outstanding", and "amazing".</p> <p>Indeed, the DVD's back jacket describes Western Canada as a country where "the highways are excellent, the campgrounds are outstanding, the scenery is beautiful and the Canadian people are wonderful."</p> <p>It is likely fair to say that most tourists come to Alberta and British Columbia not to see the cities, but rather to explore the natural beauty of the two western provinces. As well, it is likely that most tourists traveling in RVs usually stay in campgrounds that have only a landline telephone and no Internet service. The</p>	The DVD <i>Western Canada by RV</i> is a fair, albeit very basic, introduction to natural attractions of Alberta and British Columbia and it will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 19, 2006	(continued from previous page) <i>Western Canada by RV</i>		<p>hosts point out, however, that access to the Internet is readily available at other places such as Internet cafés.</p> <p>In addition to the foregoing, our reviewer did not find any evidence that the hosts had renamed Alberta and B.C. roads with American names, nor that they had made a special effort to exclude buildings from their documentary. Most of the information in the documentary is still current and useful not only to visitors from the United States, but to anyone planning a sightseeing trip through Alberta and B.C. Outdated information, such as the exchange rate and gas prices in 2000 when the DVD was produced, is not a sufficient reason for removal of this DVD from the Library's collection.</p>	
March 8, 2007	Magazines: <i>VUE</i> and <i>Gay Calgary and Edmonton Public Library</i>	The <i>Vue</i> seems to be a very negative, even dark publication (advertising section for sex workers) and the <i>Gay</i> magazine had pictures of naked back sides of men, and men in postures indicating sex.	The Edmonton Public Library's collections include one copy of <i>Vue</i> magazine, but no copies of <i>Gay Calgary and Edmonton</i> . Both publications, however, are available as free give-aways at the Library, along with many other publications, such as <i>The Edmonton Examiner, Edmonton Woman Magazine, Edmonton Seniors Magazine, Edmonton Seniors, City Palate, Edmontonians, SEE Magazine, Tribuna Latina</i> and others. All are legally published and available in Edmonton.	The copy of <i>Vue</i> magazine will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 14, 2007	Graphic novel: <i>My Sassy Girl</i>	I have read the book <i>My Sassy Girl</i> ., which my 13-year-old daughter borrowed from the Library. It contains subjects that are definitely not appropriate for young kids under 18 years. Please read — some of this stuff is illegal. My request is you start reading the anime stuff.	<p>Titles selected for the Edmonton Public Library’s collections are chosen on the basis of favourable reviews in recognized reviewing journals such as <i>Publisher’s Weekly</i> and <i>Booklist</i>. Reviews of this graphic novel were positive and considered this graphic novel to be a humorous telling of an unlikely relationship between two young adults. Based on a movie directed at a teen audience, <i>My Sassy Girl</i> is described as a dark comedy in which “[t]he narrative flows seamlessly among the captioned thoughts” (<i>Booklist</i>, 12-01-2003, p659).</p> <p>While reviews were positive, the Librarian who examined <i>My Sassy Girl</i> discovered inconsistencies in audience classification. Some reviews categorized the audience of this graphic novel as Grade 11 and up, while others had suggested ages 13 and up. The Edmonton Public Library has made the decision to move <i>My Sassy Girl</i> from the young adult collection to the adult fiction collection.</p> <p>While I appreciate your suggestion that anime (manga) should be read prior to adding it to the Edmonton Public Library collections, it would be physically impossible to read each title prior to adding it to the collection given the thousands of titles that are ordered each month.</p>	The graphic novel <i>My Sassy Girl</i> will be reclassified as adult fiction.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 14, 2007	Book: <i>Wild Fire</i> by Nelson DeMille	<p>The theme the author outlines has to do with a reprisal for 9/11 by a small group of American men belonging to a “Custer Hill Club”. Their intention is to wipe out the Muslim world by nuclear bombs initiated by the U.S. President after this group has wiped out an American city with their own rogue nuclear bomb.</p> <p>Just another hate promoting novel! What makes it even more inflammatory is the comment in the author’s note “I personally believe that some variation of Wild Fire – by another code name – actually exists, and if it doesn’t, it should.”</p> <p>Perhaps removing the book is not possible. But I do have compunctions about Canada being encouraged by the Americans to get involved in yet another hold Crusade against the infidel.</p>	<p>The novel is the fourth in a series about ex-NYPD police officer John Corey. It is the policy of the Edmonton Public Library to collect works of fiction by popular authors and to maintain titles in a series so that readers may continue reading the series as new books are released. Nelson DeMille is a popular author with many of our customers; in fact there are currently 72 people on the waiting list for this book. Please also consider that this book is a work of fiction, and while it may in part be based on actual events, the plot of the novel comes from the author’s imagination.</p> <p>While we recognize that the subject matter may be controversial to you, the book has been given starred reviews by both <i>Publishers Weekly</i> and <i>Library Journal</i>, two highly regarded reviewing journals that we regularly consult when making our selection decisions. It also received a favorable review in the <i>Globe and Mail</i>, December 9, 2006 edition, in which the reviewer described the book as “smart, tight [with a] great edge-of-the-seat plot.”</p>	The book <i>Wild Fire</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 22, 2007	Book: <i>Dolls and Bears to Make and Dress</i> (part of the Australian Women's Weekly craft library series)	Two of the doll patterns included, Golly Gosh and That Old Black Magic, are racist.	<p>Your inquiry addresses the cultural debate surrounding the Golly and other images such as the Mammy. This is a long standing debate with many facets. One aspect of the debate favours preservation of a childhood tradition and the role of these images as cultural artifacts, while opponents argue that the characters are blatant images of anti-black racism and all references should be removed. There is still yet another aspect of the debate which acknowledges that these images are racist yet must be retained as a way of remembering the past and learning from it.</p> <p>These differing positions illustrate that there is interest in the dolls for a variety of reasons. While researching this topic our reviewer came across articles on Shirley Walthall, who collects objects that dehumanized her and other black Americans. Walthall said that "it's impossible to understand black American history without understanding how pervasive such humiliating items were" ... "I don't think we should ever forget it". Also supporting the educational aspects of the images is the Jim Crow Museum of Racist Memorabilia at Ferris State University in Big Rapids, Michigan, which houses more than 5,000 racist objects. The curator, David Pilgrim, views the memorabilia as a way to teach about racism, past and present.</p>	The book <i>Dolls and Bears to Make and Dress</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 22, 2007	(continued from previous page) <i>Dolls and Bears to Make and Dress</i>		Attitudes and awareness have changed greatly from the late 19 th century to today and it appears that the intent for including these patterns is as heirloom toys remembered by some from childhood. However, it is the evolution from childhood toy to object of racism which makes these images valuable as an element of cultural debate.	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 23, 2007	Book: <i>Troll Teacher</i> by Vivian Vande Velde	The teacher throws things at the students. Ridicule and abuse by the teacher.	<p><i>Troll Teacher</i> is a children’s picture book written by Vivian Vande Velde, author of several young adult books. Vande Velde is the recipient of numerous awards, including School Library Journal Best Book of the Year, ALA Best Book for Young Adults, VOYA’s Top Shelf Fiction and Paterson Prize for Books for Young People (Grades 4 - 6). Before <i>Troll Teacher</i> was a book, it was published as a short story in the newspaper <i>Young American</i> and in <i>School Magazine</i>, which comes out in Australia. <i>Troll Teacher</i> is Vande Velde’s first children’s picture book.</p> <p>In <i>Troll Teacher</i>, Elizabeth meets the new teacher in her class, Miss Turtledove. Miss Turtledove has orange eyes, eats desks and throws fruit at the students. Every time Elizabeth tries to tell her family that there is something wrong with Miss Turtledove, they cannot see it. The adults finally become suspicious when Miss Turtledove runs off carrying the principal over her shoulder but still they refuse to admit the truth. The illustrations of the children (bug-eyed and panicked) are in contrast to the oblivious adults in this story of scary teachers and reflect disillusioned intergenerational communication.</p>	The book <i>Troll Teacher</i> will be retained in the Library’s picture book collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 23, 2007	(continued from previous page) <i>Troll Teacher</i>		<p>You have indicated that you object to “the teacher throws things at the students”. As well, you stated that you believe the theme of this book to be “silliness, ridicule and abuse by the teacher”.</p> <p>While we recognize that the subject matter may be controversial to you, the book has been given favourable reviews by both <i>School Library Journal</i> and <i>Booklist</i>, two highly regarded reviewing journals that we consult when making our selection decisions. One review states, “Vande Velde vividly captures a young person's feelings about being the only one in the world who really understands what's going on.”</p> <p>In <i>Troll Teacher</i>, Miss Turtledove teaches lessons such as “Two plus two equals seventeen. Except on Tuesdays, when they're thirty-two.” and “The capital of New York State is Bolivia.” and “George Washington invented pizza in 1954.” Through all of this, Elizabeth, a character in the book, sinks lower and lower into her seat.</p> <p>It is apparent that Elizabeth knows that this teacher is not your typical teacher. Clearly, the audience is not meant to take the actions of Miss Turtledove at face value.</p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 23, 2007	(continued from previous page) <i>Troll Teacher</i>		<p>Furthermore, Vande Velde says that she remembers what it was like to be a grade-school child waiting to see what the next year's teacher would be like. Vande Velde relates to a child's feelings of uncertainty and being afraid of what their new teacher could be like. In an interview with the author, Vande Velde says,</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><i>'I remembered how I used to get a bit nervous, just as summer vacation ended, wondering what next year's teacher would be like. And I started thinking: What if there was a teacher who was every bit as bad as Beth's friend was saying? What if she was worse? What if, in fact, she wasn't even human?'</i></p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 23, 2007	Book: <i>I Am I</i> by Marie-Louise Fitzpatrick	The anger displayed in the art and words. “I hate you, I hate you...” And the possessiveness. It’s rude!	<p>Marie-Louise Fitzpatrick is the author-illustrator of <i>Lizzy and Skunk</i>; <i>I’m a Tiger Too</i>; <i>You, Me and the Big Blue Sea</i>; and <i>The Long March</i>. She lives in Dublin, Ireland, and is the recipient of numerous awards, including the Reading Association of Ireland Children’s Book Award, and the Irish Children’s Book Trust “Book of the Decade Award”.</p> <p>In <i>I Am I</i>, two small boys wage war against each other in a parable about the futility of fighting and arguing. Their words fly through the air and form a barbed-wire fence on both sides of a stream that separates them, and then create an obstruction causing a flood. Then their words form a huge fire-breathing dragon that emerges from the water and parches the ground into a desolate scene. Finally, the battle ends and rainfall, remorse, and apologies set things right with both the land and the boys.</p> <p>You have indicated that you object to “the anger displayed in the art and words”. In particular, you state that you dislike the use of the words “I hate you”. It is clear that the author also objects to those words and wrote this parable to show children how words can either harm or heal, cause destruction or peace.</p>	The book <i>I Am I</i> will be retained in the Library’s picture book collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 23, 2007	(continued from previous page) <i>I Am I</i>		<p>Although the text is minimal, the powerful symbolism in the art may be lost on some preschoolers without explanation from a caregiver. The book lends itself to further discussion between a child and parent or teacher. It encourages parents to initiate further conversation about issues of confrontation, bullying, competition, and name calling. This thought-provoking book can provide a wonderful resource for parents and teachers on the capacity of words to wound and heal.</p> <p>This book has been favourably reviewed and recommended in the standard reviewing journals, including <i>Horn Book Guide</i>, <i>School Library Journal</i> and <i>Kirkus</i>. The reviews variously recommended this book for grades kindergarten to six, and for ages ranging from 4 to 12.</p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 27, 2007	DVD: <i>Mean Girls</i>	<p>This is a fine movie, but doesn't belong in the juvenile section – includes sex, drug references, and inappropriate language for children.</p> <p>Terrific for the teens and up. Funny and relevant. Concern is that parents might assume their supervision isn't required if the movie is labeled "juv".</p>	<p>Reviews in various movie reviewing sources, including Rotten Tomatoes (www.rottentomatoes.com) and Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide give <i>Mean Girls</i> positive reviews, particularly recognizing its appeal to teenage audiences. Having noted the positive nature of the reviews, most reviews indicate that an appropriate audience is 13 years of age and above. Considering this and the nature of the work in question, the Edmonton Public Library has decided to reclassify the DVD <i>Mean Girls</i> to the adult DVD collection.</p> <p>It is valuable to note that the Alberta Film Classification rates this film as PG: <i>Parental Guidance - "Parental guidance is advised. Theme or content may not be suitable for all children."</i> The Motion Picture Association of America rates <i>Mean Girls</i> as PG-13, which is a sterner warning to parents to determine whether their children under age 13 should view the motion picture, as some material might not be suited for them. This discrepancy may account for the film being included in the Juvenile collection.</p>	<p>The DVD <i>Mean Girls</i> will be reclassified to the Adult DVD collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 11, 2009	<i>King & King</i> by Linda de Haan	<p>Same sex – theme of homosexuality.</p> <p>Should only be for adults. Should be removed from kids' section. Have a special section with homosexual material not readily available to children.</p>	<p>Reviews of the book in library selection journals indicate that <i>King & King</i> is appropriate for children of preschool age and that “The colorful, amusing illustrations and the humor of the story will appeal to kids...”. In addition, <i>King & King</i> has been described as a “winning” title in Booklist magazine and was given a starred review by Kirkus reviews. While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this title, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library’s guidelines for inclusion in the picture book collection. The Library also recognizes that others will have different reactions to the book’s content and placement within the library’s collections.</p>	<p>The book <i>King & King</i> will remain in the picture book collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 20, 2009	<i>Vendetta</i> by Fern Michaels	<p>Objects to the theme and description. The writing is ho-hum.</p> <p>What is wrong with this material? Words that come to mind are sadistic, racist, anti-social, man-hating. The premise seems contrary to public mores.</p> <p>This book is creepy and disturbing.</p>	<p>The novel is the third book of thirteen in the Sisterhood series. It is the policy of the Edmonton Public Library to collect works of fiction by popular authors and to maintain titles in a series so that readers may continue reading the series as new books are released. Fern Michaels is a popular author with many of our customers.</p> <p>You specifically wondered who had reviewed this book and what conclusions they reached. The librarians who select material for the library refer to reviewing journals to help inform their decisions. Below are reviews from two of these journals, <u>Booklist</u> and <u>Publisher's Weekly</u>. Booklist gives it a more favorable review.</p>	The book <i>Vendetta</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 24, 2009	CD: <i>Relapse</i> by EMINEM	<p>All: Songs, lyrics, picture, message.</p> <p>Overall theme is shock value. The message between the lines may be positive, but I don't think youth will see it.</p> <p>The CD should be removed from the collection or available only to ages 18 and over.</p>	<p>The CD <i>Relapse</i> was added to the library's collection of popular music as it was a major CD release in 2009 by the popular rap musician, Eminem, who is a winner of Grammy awards and has sold 75 million albums worldwide. The album received 4 out of 5 stars on the <i>Allmusic</i> guide website and in <i>Rolling Stone</i> magazine as well as debuting in the number one spot in the music industry's <i>Billboard Magazine's</i> 200 chart. Since its release <i>Relapse</i> has sold 2.18 million copies worldwide.</p> <p>While the library acknowledges your personal response to this CD title, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in the music CD collection for adults. The CD includes a label displayed on the front with the words "Parental advisory – explicit content" which provides clear warning should anyone approach the content unknowingly. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the provision that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to.</p>	The CD <i>Relapse</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 25, 2009	DVD: <i>Fired Up!</i>	<p>Object to PG rating: First scene – Two teenage boys diving from a window to avoid consequences from parents. Second scene – Boy responds to his friends query (What are you doing today?) with “That brunette...” etc. etc. These two scenes are inappropriate for that age, in particular, degrading to the female gender.</p> <p>Would like the DVD removed from the youth collection.</p>	<p><i>Fired Up!</i> was added to the library’s collection of Flicks and Tunes to Go as it was a popular movie released in February 2009. The Flicks and Tunes collection is a browsing collection aimed at teens and young adults and includes material that is considered popular with this age group yet may not have received critical acclaim.</p> <p>While the library acknowledges your personal response to this title, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library guidelines for inclusion in the TEEN DVD collection as well as the Flicks and Tunes to Go collection. This DVD is rated PG-13 and is described as a Contemporary Teen Comedy by a major DVD supplier. The characters are high school students which would be of interest to the teen age group.</p> <p>Be assured that the material selected for the libraries collections is given careful consideration. While EPL strives to develop quality, well evaluated collections, customer demand and popularity are important factors in selecting material for youth. You are welcome to suggest titles to be added to the TEEN DVD collection through the EPL webpage.</p>	The DVD <i>Fired Up!</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 7, 2009	<i>Culture Smart! Canada</i>	Factual errors found in the book: the eastern coast of Canada is referred to as the Appalachian region on p. 13; the Prairies are referred to as the Interior (Great) Plains on p. 14; the New Democratic Party is called the National Democratic Party on p. 38; the provincial capitals of Alberta and Saskatchewan are listed as Calgary and Saskatoon on p. 40; and the Northwest Territories is referred to as the Northwest Territory on p. 55.	<p>The <i>Culture Smart!</i> guides have been published in England since 2003 by Kuperand Publishers, a large and reputable publisher, and distributed in North America by another large and reputable publisher, Random House. It is therefore disappointing to find factual errors in one of their publications. The names of the two provincial capitals and the NDP are, obviously, incorrect. However, the Appalachian Region does encompass New Brunswick, Nova Scotia, Prince Edward Island and the island of Newfoundland. They are also correct in referring to the Canadian prairies as the Interior Plains, also known as the Great Plains. Northwest Territory is probably a typing error since the NWT is correctly identified as the Northwest Territories on the map of Canada (p. 7) and elsewhere in the text.</p> <p>The <i>Culture Smart!</i> guides now cover close to 60 countries. Their aim is not to give general travel information but rather to help travelers avoid causing offense or making embarrassing faux pas by providing essential information on local customs, manners, etiquette and sensitive issues in different countries. There are very few concise guides available that offer such insights into the culture and society of a particular country, especially for less travelled-to countries and unusual destinations, and for this reason alone Kuperand's <i>Culture Smart!</i> guides can be found in the collections of all large Canadian public libraries, including the</p>	The book <i>Culture Smart! Canada</i> will remain in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Culture Smart! Canada</i></p>		<p>Calgary Public Library and the Vancouver Public Library.</p> <p>We have corrected the names of the provincial capitals, the NDP and the NWT in all three copies that are currently in our collection. We have also notified Kuperand Publishers regarding these errors and asked them to correct them in the next edition of <i>Culture Smart! Canada</i>.</p>	
October 7, 2009	<i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide 2010 Edition</i>	Racist term used in review of film <i>Broken Blossoms</i> : "Chinaman".	While the Library acknowledges your personal response to the specific review of <i>Broken Blossoms</i> in the <i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide 2010 Edition</i> , this movie guide is considered by many to be a basic source for movie reviews. In fact, the <i>New York Times Book Review</i> states that, " <i>Maltin's</i> have become the go-to choice for both film geeks and casual couch potatoes. Maltin managed to climb on top partly by being there early. He's been issuing these compendiums of thumbnail reviews since 1969, and annually since 1988. As a critic and historian, Maltin is discriminating but unflinchingly polite, more open to the ways a film works than the ways it doesn't. (His lowest ranking, besides the citation "BOMB," is a charitable one-and-a-half stars.) Maltin has also been, for many years, a regular on <i>Entertainment Tonight</i> , and people sometimes mock his eager, chipmunkish demeanor. (In his book	The book <i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide 2010 Edition</i> will remain in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
	<p>(continued from previous page)</p> <p><i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide 2010 Edition</i></p>		<p><i>The Film Snob's Dictionary</i> David Kamp notes <i>Maltin's</i> "adenoidal speaking voice" and "poindexterish appearance.") But he's earned critical respect and become a pop culture icon."</p> <p>One of the goals of any public library is to represent the full spectrum of human knowledge – the wide diversity of tastes and opinions which exist among the community it serves – and the Edmonton Public Library upholds this principle. Our function as a library is not to advocate, propagate, ignore or censor certain views. Instead, our strength lies in providing a diversity of views for the public we serve, leaving it up to readers and viewers to freely decide for themselves. To this end, the Library includes other movie guides (over 40 different titles, including <i>Videohounds Golden Video Retriever</i>) in its collection. As well, the Library website provides links to many on-line movie websites that provide reviews from a perspective other than Mr. Maltin's (www.epl.ca/EPLMaster.cfm?id=MOVIEREVIEWS0001).</p>	

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 2, 2009	DVD: <i>1900</i>	<p>Child pornography – two boys exploring their parts/masturbating/one couple raping one young boy, and murder.</p> <p>Children/adults shouldn't see that – it's too graphic. Should be 18+ Adult or Rated XX.</p>	<p>The film, <i>1900</i>, directed by the academy award winning director Bernardo Bertolucci, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources and received a rating of 3 and a half stars out of 5 in <u>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide</u>. The movie stars well-known actors including Burt Lancaster, Robert De Niro, Gerard Depardieu, and Canadian actor Donald Sutherland.</p> <p>This movie on DVD received a Canadian Home Video Restricted R rating (embossed on both discs) from the Canadian Motion Picture Distributors Association providing the viewer with fair warning that the content contains frequent use of sexual activity, brutal graphic violence, intense horror and/or other disturbing content. The R rating also restricts viewing to 18 years of age and over. Although the content of the movie is certainly graphic it does not contravene the laws governing child pornography in Canada.</p> <p>Your comments included a concern that this film should not be accessible to children. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a youth library card.</p>	The DVD <i>1900</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 16, 2010	Book: <i>Chicken Soup for the Unsinkable Soul</i>	Racist/ethnocentric content in one of the short stories in this book ("The Birthday Present", pages 176-177, by Mavis Burton Ferguson).	The <i>Chicken Soup</i> books have been a long-standing and popular series with customers and have received wide acclamation by reviewers for years. While the Library acknowledges your personal response to a story in this <i>Chicken Soup</i> title, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in our adult collections. With the exception of specific <i>Chicken Soup</i> titles such as <i>Chicken Soup for the Kid's Soul</i> , <i>Chicken Soup for the Teen's Soul</i> or <i>Chicken Soup for the Preteen Soul</i> , all the books in the series are considered part of the adult collection.	The book <i>Chicken Soup for the Unsinkable Soul</i> will be retained in the Library's adult collection.
May 6, 2010	DVD: <i>In the Realm of the Senses</i>	This movie is very disturbing, deals with and shows explicit sex acts. It should be labeled "Adults Only".	This movie is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.	The DVD <i>In the Realm of the Senses</i> will be retained in the Library's adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
May 28, 2010	Book: <i>Calf Roping</i> by Roy Cooper	Calf roping, to put it simply, is cruel. Because it is, the library, I believe, shouldn't have a book that details how to do it. Please do not promote cruelty to helpless animals.	<p>The book <i>Calf Roping</i> was acquired in 2005 to support the Library's collection of materials on rodeos. While much of this collection is biographical or historical in nature, some of the items, such as this one, are handbooks to specific events. Statistics show that rodeos still have a significant role in western culture and the Library has collected material on this topic as part of its mandate to support the cultural and recreational interests of its citizens.</p> <p>The Library acknowledges your personal response to this book and to issues related to the welfare and treatment of rodeo animals. You have suggested that our collections should include materials that detail the cruelty of rodeos. You may be interested to know that we have many titles in our collection under the subjects of "animal rights" and "animal welfare" and a number of these books, such as <i>The PETA Practical Guide to Animal Rights</i>, speak directly to the subject of rodeos. In addition, many of our magazine databases are excellent sources of information on this topic.</p>	The book <i>Calf Roping</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 30, 2010	Book: <i>Egg Drop</i> by Mini Grey	<p>The story implies the egg dies before the chick can live. My granddaughter is 3 ½ and was very upset about the egg. The illustrations of the eggs bandaged and “fixed” was disturbing to her. The concept of life and death is just too difficult for a 3 year old to comprehend in this format.</p> <p>Would like the book moved into an older age group category.</p>	<p>Careful consideration is given to the materials added to the library’s collections. Reviews of this book in library selection journals indicate that <i>Egg Drop</i> is appropriate for children of preschool age. This book has been described by School Library Journal as a “wonderfully subversive reinterpretation of a Humpty-Dumpty-like tale” and by Booklist “as a cautionary tale about rushing to undertake something for which one is not quite ready”. While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this title, it does fall within the guidelines for inclusion in the picture book collection. The Library also recognizes that others may have different reactions to the book’s content and placement within its collections.</p>	<p>The book <i>Egg Drop</i> will be retained in the Library’s picture book collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 27, 2010	Book: <i>The Complete Fairy Tales of Charles Perrault</i> translated by Neil Philip and Nicoletta Simborowski	<p>I object to the location as to where I found this particular book. This book is full of disturbing and cruel content. As a mother, I strongly oppose to having any parent think it's an "appropriate" kid friendly book, only to find out its content should be rated PG or PG-13.</p> <p>Would like the book to be moved to the adult section.</p>	<p>Recently, the Edmonton Public Library reviewed its children's collections to ensure that all service points had comparable collections. In doing so, some titles were relabelled and/or moved to new collections in error. The copy in question was one of those titles, as it was incorrectly labelled for the picture book collection. This copy will be relabelled as a juvenile nonfiction book and removed from the picture book area.</p> <p>Reviews in reviewing journals such as <i>Booklist</i> and <i>Kirkus</i> indicate an audience of grades four to six, reinforcing the placement of this book in the juvenile nonfiction and not the adult nonfiction collection as you suggest.</p>	The Book <i>The Complete Fairy Tales of Charles Perrault</i> will be relabeled as a juvenile nonfiction book and removed from the picture book area.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 7, 2011	Book on CD: <i>Murder Game</i> by Christine Feehan	<p>All the sexual “scenes” are far too explicit for younger audiences/people.</p> <p>Would recommend this CD for over 18 only to view/pick up.</p>	<p>This book is one in a series of novels written by Christine Feehan and they are very popular with library customers. <i>Library Journal</i> reviewed this book on CD and noted the sexual nature of the material.</p> <p><i>Actor/narrator Tom Stechschulte (The Big Oyster) does a stellar job of capturing the rough edge of the GhostWalkers while barely stumbling over the clunky dialog and repetitive turns of phrase. For those who like raunchy romance with a bit of fantasy. [The Jove pb was described as a "dark, sexy, violence-packed thriller," LJ 12/08.- Ed.]</i></p> <p>While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this CD, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library’s guidelines for inclusion in the adult book on CD collection.</p>	The Book on CD <i>Murder Game</i> will be retained in the Library’s adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 3, 2011	DVD: <i>Globe Trekker: Panama & Colombia</i>	<p>I object to a specific scene where the show host Megan McCormick and her guide head off into the jungle to be shown how to extract cocaine from coca leaves. Irrelevant for any traveler; dangerous if the average individual wished to repeat it; makes light of the very things the Colombian government wants to remove from its image. Flippant approach on part of host.</p> <p>Would like the DVD removed. The cocaine segment is really a bother and I believe misrepresents the aim of making such travel DVDs.</p>	<p>Globe Trekker (formerly Lonely Planet), produced by the Pilot Films & TV Productions since 1990, is an award-winning series which now broadcasts to over 30 million viewers in over 40 countries. It is intended not only for someone planning a trip but also for the armchair traveler who wants to learn about a country and its culture from the comfort of home. Ms. McCormick has been a presenter for the Globe Trekker for many years and although her presentation style may not appeal to everyone her shows have been very popular.</p> <p>The Colombian government has done a lot to make the country safer for the traveler, but the fact remains that Colombia is part of a major drug producing and smuggling route and still produces roughly 80 per cent of the world's cocaine. Ms. McCormick visits the small coca plantation in an undisclosed location in order, as she puts it," to understand the trade and the dangers of cocaine." She points out that these plantations are in rural areas which are often controlled by rebels and tells the viewer to "get government advice before travelling to rural areas."</p>	The DVD <i>Globe Trekker: Panama & Colombia</i> will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 10, 2011	Book: <i>Body Drama</i> by Nancy Amanda Redd	When I had read the title of the book I thought it was about acting, but I had found very embarrassing pictures of naked women. My daughter was standing just beside me and that has bothered her a lot.	<p>This title has received many positive reviews, including from VOYA (Voice of Youth Advocates). VOYA is a reviewing journal for material selected for library collections. VOYA rated the book four out of five for quality and five out of five for popularity and indicated it would be appropriate for a junior high audience. It does indicate that graphic photos are present in the work. The American Library Association placed this title on its booklist “Quick Picks for Reluctant Young Readers”.</p> <p>Although geared to a teen audience, <i>Body Drama</i> may be considered inappropriate for the younger teens that use Edmonton Public Library’s collections. After discussion with EPL’s Teen Services Librarian and considering the explicit nature of this title, the book will be recatalogued and shelved in the adult collection.</p>	The book <i>Body Drama</i> by Nancy Amanda Redd will be recatalogued and shelved in the adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
June 15, 2011	Book: <i>Beyond the Dark</i> by Lora Leigh, Angela Knight, Emma Holly and Diane Whiteside	The book should have an explicit warning to alert readers to the “very explicit language, crude wording and scenes (anal sex), etc.”	<p>This book was published by Jove under their paranormal imprint. Paranormal Romance is a romance but with the supernatural or paranormal impacting on the relationship. The authors included in this book are all well-known writers in this genre.</p> <p>The popular romance website, RT, www.rtbookreviews.com/book-review/beyond-dark reviewed this book and said the following:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Red-hot passion and blistering adventure are two reasons why you need asbestos gloves to handle this new anthology. While two stories build on worlds previously introduced, the others have brand-new, fantastic worlds.</p> <p>The inclusion of this book in the adult paperback collection alerts all customers to the fact that the content is intended for adults. The description on the back of the book, which asks the reader to “go beyond your wildest fantasies”, to “go beyond your most forbidden dreams” and to “go further than any woman has ever dared to go” provides further details on the book’s content.</p>	The book: <i>Beyond the Dark</i> by Lora Leigh, Angela Knight, Emma Holly and Diane Whiteside, will not have any explicit warnings added to the material.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
June 15, 2011	Book: <i>The Storm in the Barn</i> by Matt Phelan	Objects to the foul language, and concern with the depiction of violence and horror images within the work.	<p>Reviews of <i>The Storm in the Barn</i> overwhelmingly recommend it for children in grades five to seven, as does the publisher and author. <i>Booklist</i>, the reviewing journal of the American Library Association, gives it a starred review recommending it for upper elementary readers. Library Media Connection, which reviews material for school libraries, indicated that this title is “a must have for all elementary graphic novels collections”.</p> <p>This particular title is striving to depict an era in history that is particularly harsh and unforgiving, using stark illustrations and careful use of colour and language. An accurate representation in historical novels requires the use of era appropriate language, such as the strong language found in <i>The Storm in the Barn</i>. This story features an eleven year old boy, the audience for the book, allowing readers to relive Jack’s experience.</p> <p>Various EPL librarians, including the librarian responsible for youth collections, have assessed the book and related reviews and have recommended that <i>The Storm in the Barn</i> by Matt Phelan remain in the children’s fiction collection of the Edmonton Public Library.</p>	The book <i>The Storm in the Barn</i> by Matt Phelan will remain in the children’s fiction collection of the Library.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 4, 2012	Book: <i>Demon Hunter</i> by Steve Skidmore	Objects to the cover pictures (front and back). Content not appropriate for children.	<p>This title, and others in the series <i>iHorror</i>, are recommended by the publisher for children ages nine and up, which is considered suitable for the children's section of Edmonton Public Library. The language, short passages and use of illustration are appropriate for children in grades four and up.</p> <p>The <i>iHorror</i> series, as well as other series written by the authors, are geared to reluctant readers and employ many strategies to attract children that might not otherwise attempt reading a novel. Included in these strategies are the interactive nature of the "choose your ending" novel, use of mythology and the artwork on the cover and within the novel. These elements, while not appropriate for all readers, are very appealing to the reluctant reader, particularly boys. The Edmonton Public Library strives to provide material for all readers regardless of skill or interest.</p> <p>EPL recognises the value the title <i>Demon Hunters</i> may have in motivating reluctant juvenile readers and will continue to shelve it and similar titles in the children's collection.</p>	The book <i>Demon Hunter</i> by Steven Skidmore will remain in the children's collection of the Library.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 27, 2012	Book: <i>Encyclopedia of the African Diaspora</i> by Boyce Davies	Objects to two errors identified in the text in the sections on <i>Abu-Jamal, Mumia (1954-)</i> and <i>Abyssinia/Ethiopia</i> .	We have contacted the publisher, ABC-CLIO, and they will have the necessary corrections made in the electronic version of the book and in any additional print runs made of the book.	
February 21, 2012	DVD: <i>Raid on Entebbe</i>	<p>Within the trailers of the main menu, found an ad for a porn film, the acting of ritual murders, and that it was available through my library. In the wrong hands, it could be influential in a negative manner.</p> <p>The DVD from this provider should not be released for public use through the library. Obtain a copy through other providers and screen them if possible.</p>	<p>The movie <i>Raid on Entebbe</i> is included in the Library's collection as it was nominated for and received several awards and is based on a significant historic event. The Library purchased this movie DVD for the main movie content rather than for the trailers, which are unknown at the time of purchase. The trailers that are included with the film are purely at the discretion of the producer of the DVD. The viewer does not need to watch the trailers, as the PLAY button is available immediately on the first screen. This version of the film is the only one currently available for us to purchase.</p> <p>Your comments included a concern that the content of the trailer could end up in the "wrong hands". This movie is housed in the adult section of the Library's collections. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.</p>	The DVD <i>Raid on Entebbe</i> will be retained in the Library's adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 24, 2012	DVD: <i>I Love You Phillip Morris</i>	The sexual content, specifically the content dealing with homosexuality.	<p>The film, directed by John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources. It received 3 stars out of a possible 5 in <i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide</i> and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. The storyline of this movie is based on the biographical book entitled <i>I love you Phillip Morris : a true story of life, love and prison breaks</i> by Steve McVicker, which is also included in the non-fiction collection of the Library.</p> <p>Your comments included a concern about the sexual content of this film, specifically the content dealing with homosexuality. The Library's Material Selection Policy mandates the purchase of library materials taking into account the diverse interests of all of the communities of Edmonton including content that reflects the interests of the gay and lesbian community. This movie title is clearly labeled with an R-rating which is indicated on the DVD container, the disc and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. The catalogue indicates the suitability of this title as: "MPAA rating R for sexual content including strong dialogue, and language".</p>	The DVD <i>I Love You Phillip Morris</i> will be retained in the Library's adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
May 25, 2012	Book: <i>Do Not Open</i> by John Farndon	The content is not appropriate for children and specifically references the subject areas of murder, assassination and Hitler. Your recommendation is to move the title into the adult collection.	<p>The publisher, Dorling Kindersley, recommends this title for ages 8-17. As well, reviews in reviewing journals indicate that <i>Do Not Open</i> is appropriate for grades four and up. School Library Journal praises the title indicating that it contains “cleverly organized information” and has “perennial kid-appeal of topics”.</p> <p><i>Do Not Open</i> contains information about a variety of subjects, presented in a format that is very appealing to younger readers. Information is factual and presented in small text boxes with ample illustration. The content is indicated as being “spooky”, “spine chilling” and “unthinkable” and therefore not appropriate for all readers.</p>	The book <i>Do not Open</i> will be retained in the Library’s children’s non-fiction collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 11, 2012	DVD: <i>I Love You Phillip Morris</i>	<p>This dud is unacceptable material to be on the shelves at EPL due to the explicit scenes of sexuality which children have access to at a public library. It is the responsibility of EPL to properly screen materials and ensure the suitability for non-offensive material for EPL members.</p> <p>I have used EPL for many years. I am disgusted and appalled at EPL for allowing such obscene and disgusting material to be so easily accessed by our children. Please make the appropriate decision and remove this material.</p>	<p>The film <i>I love you Phillip Morris</i>, directed by John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources. It received 3 stars out of a possible 5 in <i>Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide</i> and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. The storyline of this movie is based on the biographical book entitled <i>I love you Phillip Morris : a true story of life, love and prison breaks</i> by Steve McVicker, which is also included in the non-fiction collection of the Library.</p> <p>You expressed concern over the explicit sexual nature of this movie and that it should not be accessible to children. This movie title is clearly labeled with an R-rating which is indicated on the DVD container, the disc and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. This movie is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library.</p>	The DVD <i>I Love You Phillip Morris</i> will be retained in the Library's adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 24, 2012	DVD: <i>Disney's A Christmas Carol</i>	<p>A scene regarding the ghost of Christmas present. May be too scary for young children 2 – 7 yrs (approx.).</p> <p>Recommends moving the DVD from the juvenile to the teen area.</p>	<p><i>Disney's A Christmas Carol</i> was widely reviewed and received mixed reviews for quality, but was generally recognized as a family film appropriate for ages nine and up. Occasional reviews noted that some children may find certain scenes frightening, echoing your concerns.</p> <p>The Edmonton Public Library recognizes its role in providing guidance to customers and to that end EPL categorizes material according to approximate age appropriateness. Material included in the children's collection that is marked J is considered appropriate for ages 7 to 12. This includes the audience for <i>Disney's A Christmas Carol</i>, and for this reason <i>Disney's A Christmas Carol</i> will not be moved from the J collection.</p>	The DVD <i>Disney's A Christmas Carol</i> will be retained in the Library's Juvenile collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 19, 2012	DVD: <i>The Snowtown Murders</i>	Movie depicted graphic, prolonged scenes of human torture and child abuse. Animal abuse is also graphically depicted.	<p>The storyline of this movie is based on the real, horrifying murders discovered in Snowtown, Australia, in 1999 as indicated in the library catalogue summary. Although the movie is not rated, the cover of the DVD case gives fair warning of the graphic, violent nature with quotes from several reviews including “genuinely disturbing” from a New York Times review and “profoundly disturbing” from Film Comment. The movie is also inspired by two books: <i>Killing for Pleasure</i> by Debi Marshall and <i>The Snowtown Murders</i> by Andrew McGarry.</p> <p>The film <i>The Snowtown Murders</i>, directed by Justin Kurzel, is included in the Library’s collection as it is well reviewed in several sources and received several awards. Roger Ebert of the Chicago Sun Times assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. Awards include Best direction of a feature film from the Australian Directors Guild and several awards from the Australian Film Institute, including Best adapted screenplay and Best direction. The director also received Special Mentions during Critics Week at the Cannes Film Festival in 2011.</p>	The DVD <i>The Snowtown Murders</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 29, 2012	Book: <i>Simple Times: Crafts for Poor People</i> by Amy Sedaris	Your specific concern is with the cataloguing of this book by the Library in the crafts section. You would like to have it re-catalogued as a comedy book or removed from the collection.	<p>Recognizing that there is a certain satirical element to the content, this title has been classified as a book of handicrafts, as the primary focus is the instructional content for various crafting activities with the secondary focus being humour. This is reflected in the assigned subject headings of – Handicraft and – Handicraft—Humor, in the Library’s catalogue.</p> <p>We have checked the largest bibliographic cataloguing database used jointly by most libraries and the majority of other libraries that have this book in their holdings have also classified it in their handicrafts sections with the call number as 745.5.</p>	The book <i>Simple Times: Crafts for Poor People</i> will be kept in its current location of Handicrafts with the call number as 745.5 SED.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 2, 2013	Book: <i>Deadly Sins</i> by Thomas Pynchon, et al.	Objects to this book being on EPL shelves because it “entices and encourages people to actually commit these sins listed in the book” and that any book that “would encourage and glorify sin does not belong in a Christian’s life or anybody else’s life.”	<p><i>Deadly Sins</i> is a collection of eight essays written by some of the best contemporary writers, including Thomas Pynchon, Mary Gordon, Gore Vidal, John Updike and Joyce Carol Oates, which were originally published in the New York Times Book Review during the summer of 1993. Each author reflects thoughtfully on one of the seven deadly sins, plus despair, and looks at it from his or her personal and often unique perspective.</p> <p>The book was favorably reviewed in several newspapers and journals. <i>The Vancouver Sun</i> (March 30, 1996) described it as a collection of “slight, often witty, generally entertaining ruminations on universal temptations.” <i>The Province</i> (March 31, 1996) characterized it as “a literary feast fashioned by seven authors of international stature for the New York Times Book Review.” <i>The Publishers Weekly</i> (October 3, 1994) stated that the, “...anthology considers, one by one, the legendary seven deadly sins. But in addition to sloth, anger, lust, gluttony, avarice, pride and envy, this volume includes despair, which Joyce Carol Oates calls “the sole sin that cannot be forgiven.” Although each reflection is engaging and thoughtful, Mary Gordon's description of the murderous nature of anger is especially powerful. William Trevor's experience with a gluttonous accountant skates along the thin line separating comedy and tragedy, and Richard Howard offers a poem about avarice. Each sin is whimsically represented by one of Delessert's playful black-and-white line illustrations.”</p>	The book <i>Deadly Sins</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 15, 2013	Magazines: <i>Allure</i> and <i>GQ</i>	Requests that the Library “seriously consider pre-adult exposure to the covers” of certain magazines, specifically <i>Allure</i> (December 2012) and <i>GQ</i> (December 2012).	<p>The Edmonton Public Library subscribes to hundreds of magazines that cover a wide range of subject matter and interests. We do not screen magazine covers or content before we put them out for use by the public.</p> <p>While the library acknowledges your personal response to these magazines, they do fall within the Edmonton Public Library’s guidelines for inclusion in the magazine collection.</p>	The Library will not screen magazine covers or content before putting them out for use by the public.
February 14, 2013	DVD: <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i>	Expressed concern over the cover illustrations that depict violent actions, seemingly identifying the content of the DVD. Noted that this content would be inappropriate for viewing by young children.	<p>This DVD is misrepresented by the artwork on the cover. The content is a collection of fairy tale retellings previously produced as <i>Shelley Duval’s Faerie Tale Theatre</i>. These retellings were originally produced in the 1980s and have been popular at EPL since then. They are gentle, humourous and well-reviewed.</p> <p>Often, published works are repackaged to update the appeal to current audiences; this appears to be the case with <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i>. While EPL has no control over the packaging we agree that the current artwork does not fairly represent the content of the DVD or appeal to the appropriate audience. EPL will replace the artwork on <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i> with artwork that is more age appropriate or generic in nature. <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i> will remain in the children’s collection.</p>	The Library will replace the artwork on <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i> with artwork that is more age appropriate or generic in nature. <i>Grimm’s Fairy Tales</i> will remain in the children’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 9, 2013	Book: <i>It's a Book</i> by Lane Smith	A children's book with the last line "It's a book, jackass" is not appropriate for the intended audience. It looks like it's made for kids 2-6 years old, but the subversive twist at the end makes it a picture book for grown-ups. Recommend adding a language warning to the title or remove it from the children's collection.	This title has been well reviewed by numerous library reviewing journals and mainstream press. While some acknowledge the possible controversy surrounding the final line, <i>It's a Book</i> has overwhelmingly positive reviews describing it as "a clever choice" and "kid friendly". <i>It's a Book</i> has a recommended reading age of six and up by the publisher and many library reviewing journals.	The book <i>It's a Book</i> will be retained in the Library's picture book collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 14, 2013	DVD: <i>Easter Bunny Puppy</i>	The DVD contains content inappropriate for the age group. Specifically, a reference to murder and ancient Egyptian fertility rites. Not appropriate for 3 – 7 year olds. Requests that this title be moved into the Adult collection and a rating of PG added to it.	<p>This title is unrated, meaning that it has not been assigned a classification (G, PG, etc.) by the Motion Picture Association of America or the Canadian Home Video Rating System. It is not the role of the Library to assign or reassign these ratings.</p> <p>EPL does use its own classification system to help guide its customers when selecting appropriate material, particularly for young viewers and readers. The DVD <i>Easter Bunny Puppy</i> is classified in the J (juvenile) collection which indicates that the intended audience is ages eight to 12; as well, the supplier of the DVD lists this title as a "Family Film", indicating that it is suitable for a range of viewers.</p> <p>You indicated in your Request for Reconsideration of Library Material form that this title is not appropriate for children ages three to seven. EPL agrees that a more appropriate audience is children ages eight to 12, as indicated by the J classification.</p> <p>EPL strives to provide a broad range of material to its customers and while you felt the content of <i>Easter Bunny Puppy</i> was not suitable for your family, this title has been popular since being added to the collection in April, 2013. The librarian responsible for Children's Collections has reviewed this title, with the intended audience in mind, and EPL has decided to leave this title in the J fiction DVD collection, without additional labels as to content.</p>	The DVD <i>Easter Bunny Puppy</i> will be retained in the Library's Juvenile collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 18, 2013	DVD: <i>The Muppets' Wizard of Oz</i>	This DVD contains material that is inappropriate for young viewers, particularly under the age of six. More appropriate for adolescents and pre-teen than young kids. Opening scene is graphic depiction of a house being destroyed and sucked up by a tornado and then dropped.	<p><i>The Muppets' Wizard of Oz</i> has been rated TV-PG by the Motion Picture Association of America, indicating that it may contain material that is inappropriate for young viewers, noting age 7 and below. The story is summarized on the disc case with a specific reference to the tornado.</p> <p>EPL does use its own classification system to help guide our customers when selecting appropriate material, particularly for young viewers and readers. The DVD <i>Muppets' Wizard of Oz</i> is classified in the J (juvenile) collection which indicates that the intended audience is ages eight to 12; as well, the supplier of the DVD lists this title as a "Family Film", indicating that it is suitable for a range of viewers.</p> <p>You indicated in your Request for Reconsideration of Library Material form that this title is not appropriate for children ages six and under. EPL agrees that a more appropriate audience is children ages eight to 12, as indicated by the J classification.</p> <p>EPL strives to provide a broad range of material to its customers, and while you felt the content of <i>The Muppets' Wizard of Oz</i> was not suitable for your family this title has been popular since being included in the EPL collection in 2005. The librarian responsible for Children's Collections has reviewed this title, with the intended audience in mind, and EPL has decided to leave this title in the J fiction DVD collection without additional labels as to content.</p>	The DVD <i>The Muppets' Wizard of Oz</i> will be retained in the Library's Juvenile collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 20, 2013	Language learning kit: <i>Teach Yourself Gulf Arabic</i>	<p>Objects to the title <i>Gulf Arabic</i> as well as to the numerous references throughout the text to the term Arabian Gulf. In his opinion the correct title of the publication should be Persian Arabic and the Arabian Gulf should be referred to in the text as the Persian Gulf. Customer states the United Nations have established a rule/charter regarding this and this publication contravenes this ruling.</p> <p>Customers finds the text extremely offensive and would like the title removed permanently from the collection.</p>	<p><i>Wikipedia</i> defines Gulf Arabic as “a variety of the Arabic language spoken around the shores of the Persian Gulf” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gulf_Arabic). A search of The Alberta Library catalogue (www.talonline.ca) shows that Gulf Arabic is a standard term used for Arabic language learning titles. While the term Arabian Gulf may be controversial, a search of The Alberta Library catalogue and the Internet shows that it is still frequently being used.</p> <p>In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will retain the language learning kit <i>Teach Yourself Gulf Arabic</i> in its collection. However, you may wish to contact the publisher, McGraw-Hill, to express your concern regarding the use of the terms Gulf Arabic and Arabian Gulf in their publication. McGraw-Hill Customer Service can be reached in Canada by telephone at 1-800-565-5758 or by email at cs_queries@mcgrawhill.ca.</p>	The Language learning kit <i>Teach Yourself Gulf Arabic</i> will be retained in the Library’s collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 28, 2013	Book: <i>Styx</i> by Sherrilyn Kenyon	<p>Repeated sexual and physical abuse of young boy, causing adult psychological trauma.</p> <p>The material should be identified as containing explicit child sexual abuse and not a “paranormal romance”.</p> <p>I have paid the replacement cost for the novel and will burn it to save others from being exposed to this material.</p>	<p>This book was published by St. Martin’s Press and is number 23 in the Dark-Hunters series by Kenyon. We do not place warning labels regarding the content on any of the books we hold in our collection. The Edmonton Public Library makes every effort to maintain books in an entire series.</p> <p>While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library’s guidelines for inclusion in the collection for adults. The policy of the Library is to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. The inclusion of this book in the adult fiction collection alerts all customers to the fact that the content is intended for adults. While the subject matter may be considered graphic and offensive to some, Edmonton Public Library requests that you return the borrowed material in good condition as soon as you are able.</p>	The book will be retained in the Library’s Adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 12, 2013	Book: <i>Pirates</i> by Philip Steele	<p>Object to the "violent and gruesome" content of <i>Pirates</i>, a Kingfisher level four reader.</p> <p>Request that the title be removed from the Easy Reader collection and placed in the teen or adult collection.</p> <p>Would like the title affixed with a warning label.</p>	<p>This title is written specifically for the beginning reader, using controlled vocabulary and illustrations that highlight the text. As well, the author, Philip Steele, is an established author of children's nonfiction titles who strives to make his works appealing to young readers. While EPL realizes the value of an interesting nonfiction topic, such as pirates, to beginning readers, we agree that the content of this particular title does not strictly match the Easy Reader audience.</p> <p>EPL will be retaining the title in its juvenile collections but it will be moved to the children's paperback nonfiction collection. This collection appeals to readers grade 4 and up and is a suitable match for the title <i>Pirates</i>.</p> <p>EPL does not attach labels to material other than for purposes of classification and shelving. While some material is assessed for genre, EPL does not judge material for content that may be considered questionable recognizing that different readers appreciate different content. For this reason, EPL will not affix warning labels to this or any work held in its collections.</p>	<p>The book will be retained in the Juvenile collection, but will be moved to the children's paperback nonfiction collection.</p> <p>A warning label will not be affixed to the title.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
January 16, 2014	Graphic Novel Series: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>I Don't Like You at All, Big Brother</i> • <i>Vampire Cheerleaders</i> • <i>Oreimo</i> 	Sexually explicit and not appropriate for the Teen collection. Recommend removing the series from EPL's collection. (Complainant is also representing a Catholic Homeschool Association.)	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the three series titles in question as well as consulted a variety of reviewing sources for manga. After careful consideration, EPL has decided to maintain these series but to move them to the adult graphic novel collection, which is a more suitable audience.	The series will be retained in EPL's collection, but will be moved from the Teen collection to the Adult Graphic Novel collection.
May 7, 2014	Magazine: <i>Maxim</i>	"Please take action to eliminate such material from our beloved EPL."	The Edmonton Public Library subscribes to hundreds of magazines that cover a wide range of subject matter and interests. While the library acknowledges your personal response to this magazine, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in the magazine collection.	The magazine will be retained in the Library's collection.
August 28, 2014	Picture book: <i>Donovan's Big Day</i> by Leslea Newman	Title should not be allowed to be borrowed without parental consent or be labeled to indicate content.	This title has received many positive reviews in library reviewing journals with most noting the focus of the title to be the young boy preparing for an event rather than same sex marriage. While EPL acknowledges your response to this title, and respects your belief that it is not appropriate for your children, we are aware that other parents and readers want to expose their children to the topic of same sex marriage. Therefore, EPL will continue to provide unlimited access to it and similar titles without special labelling to indicate the book's content.	The picture book will remain in the Children's collection and will not be labeled for content.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 3, 2014	Chinese children's book: <i>Nuts Sisters, Volume 2</i>	<p>Felt this book was not for children or teens. Passages referenced "Let's go to bed", "I refuse" and "don't cheat your body tell me you need", and also "No! It's just my pistol, don't misunderstand" and "it's just the same" alluding to genitalia.</p> <p>Recommends moving item to adult section.</p>	We have examined this material and, after careful consideration, have decided to maintain this series but to move the books to the Teen Chinese collection, which is a more suitable audience.	The series will be moved from the Children's collection to the Teen Chinese collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
September 3, 2014	Feature film DVD: <i>Wake in Fright</i>	The depiction of animal cruelty included in this film.	<p>Although the movie does not have a stated rating, the information on the back cover of the DVD case provides an indication of the violent nature of this movie. This movie was lost for several decades, was re-discovered and restored by the Australian Film Archive and recently made available on DVD. According to a review by the well-known critic Roger Ebert, available on the Internet Movie Database (IMDB), “the footage of an actual kangaroo hunt was seamlessly edited in by the editor, and a producer's note says this documentary footage was included with the participation of animal rights' organizations”. This indicates that the scene to which you are objecting was not created specifically for this movie. The ratings for this movie that are available on the IMDB website are M(ature) for Australia, and R for the USA, 18 for the UK.</p> <p>The film, <i>Wake in Fright</i> (1971, original title <i>Outback</i>) directed by Canadian-born Ted Kotcheff, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several reliable sources. Leonard Maltin assigned 3 stars out of 5 to this movie in his <i>Movie Guide</i> and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5. In addition, this movie was nominated for the Palme d'Or award at the Cannes Film Festival in 1971 and also named as an Official Selection Cannes Classic in 2009.</p>	The DVD will be retained in the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 8, 2014	Book: <i>3D Printing</i> by Kevin Roebuck	The book's content is a compilation of Wikipedia articles and the information is therefore dubious.	<p>Upon investigation, we have determined that this is true. The 3D Printing articles available on Wikipedia have changed significantly since this book was published, so we cannot verify whether that chapter was copied for this book. However, many of the other chapters (e.g. Mezzotint, Dye-Sublimation Printer, etc.) are direct copies of articles from a Wikipedia series entitled "History of Printing". Furthermore, some of these articles have been flagged in Wikipedia as lacking suitable citations and sources.</p> <p>That said, we also strive to ensure that our collection is adequately up-to-date and that our non-fiction material remains relevant for our customers. As a result, we have decided to replace this title.</p>	The book will be removed from the Library's collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 3, 2014	Audiobook: <i>Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety</i> by Daniel Smith	The audiobook should include a caveat on the cover indicating the dark adult content contained therein.	<p>While EPL acknowledges your personal response to <i>Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety</i>, the item does fall within EPL's guidelines for inclusion in the adult non-fiction collection. The title also comes recommended from various review journals including the September 2012 edition of <i>AudioFile Magazine</i> and the December 2012 edition of <i>Library Journal</i>.</p> <p>This particular item is held in our adult non-fiction collection signifying that it is oriented towards adults.</p>	EPL will retain the <i>Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety</i> audiobook in its adult collection without a caveat.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
December 19, 2014	Book: <i>Summer Moon</i> by Jan DeLima	The passionate scenes included in the book are not suitable for young readers.	While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in the adult collection. The policy of the Library is to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. The inclusion of this book in the adult paperback collection alerts all customers to the fact that the content is intended for adults. The description on the back of the book, hints at the content of the book, by mentioning "the intense physical need the wild she-wolf awakens".	EPL will retain <i>Summer Moon</i> in its adult collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 17, 2015	Book: <i>Legends from China: Three Kingdoms</i> by Wei Dong Chen and Xiao Long Liang	There are suggestive, sexual and visual, sexual scenes, and the possibility of violence. It is inappropriate for the juvenile graphic novel collection.	We have reviewed the series in question and consulted a variety of reviewing resources for school and public libraries to determine the appropriate location for these titles. This series is positively reviewed in all sources consulted but is recommended for age 12 and up due to the complexity of the subject matter. As a result, the Edmonton Public Library will retain the series in its collections but move it to the teen graphic novel collection.	EPL will retain <i>Legends from China: Three Kingdoms</i> but move it to the teen graphic novel collection.
October 20, 2015	Book: <i>Dk Readers, Star Wars, Darth Maul-Sith Apprentice</i> by Jo Casey and Catherine Sanders	The graphic content of this item is not age appropriate. The book in question is based on a film that is rated PG-13 while the book is geared towards young readers.	The primary users of this collection are preschool and elementary aged beginning readers with a wide range of interests and skill levels, requiring a broad collection of material including a variety of reading levels, writing styles, and topics. As a result, this material is shelved as a single collection, regardless of publisher, series, and reading level. Shelving in this fashion also serves to assist readers and caregivers in finding and continuing with preferred series and publishers.	EPL acknowledges that other users of this collection will have different reactions and will maintain this and similar titles in the Easy Reader collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 9, 2015	Book: <i>Carsick</i> by John Waters	The book does not belong in the travels section as parts of the book are made up of the author's x-rated fantasy hitch-hiking.	While EPL acknowledges your personal response to <i>Carsick</i> , the item does fall within EPL's guidelines for inclusion in the adult non-fiction collection. <i>Carsick</i> has been assigned the Dewey number 917.30493, which is the classification for travel in the US in the 21st century. This is appropriate when the traveling is factual whether in whole or in part.	'...EPL's cataloguing decision will remain unchanged. Other public libraries have placed the book in their travel sections as well, including Vancouver Public Library and Ottawa Public Library.'
January 19, 2016	Book: <i>Arvida</i> by Samuel Archibald	Explicit description of child rape. "Child pornography is against the law, and explicit depiction of child rape breaks the law."	In reviewing the passage you mentioned (p. 103), I am confident that this book does not advocate sexual activity with a person under the age of eighteen years. The book could not be described as one in which the "dominant characteristic is the description, for a sexual purpose, of sexual activity with a person under the age of eighteen years." While the description in the passage may be graphic, it is not the dominant theme of the book.	While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in the collection for adults. The policy of the Library is to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 3, 2016	<i>Graveyard Book, Volume 1</i> , illustrated P.Craig Russell	Age appropriateness of illustrations- violent and graphic	The publisher of this title, Harper Collins, lists this title as appropriate for age eight to 12, which fits within the guidelines of Edmonton Public Library's (EPL) Children's Graphic Novel collection. Many of the reviews of this title, however, place it slightly above the age range for the children's collection, specifically grades six and up. The reviews also note the increased pace of the story and the gothic imagery that may be less accessible for young readers.	"For these reasons, and the concern raised about the graphic content, EPL has decided to maintain this title in our collections but move it to the teen graphic novel collection. The novel that this graphic novel is based on will remain in the children's fiction collection."
March 24, 2016	<i>Sports Illustrated</i> (swimsuit edition)	Visual soft pornography or porn of any type is inappropriate	In fulfilling this mandate, the Calder Branch subscribes to Sports Illustrated, a very popular, well-circulating magazine which is legally available to citizens whether at convenience stores or at the local branch of the public library. However, in addition to this magazine, it is essential to recognize that Calder's adult magazine collection represents a broad range of opinions and interests.	"In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will not be pre-screening magazines before they are put on display, nor will we be removing this issue of Sports Illustrated."

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 10, 2016	<i>Cage of Eden Vol 4 & 5</i> by Yoshinobu Yamada	Mature content contains extreme violence, murder and rape.	The librarian responsible for Youth Collections has reviewed the series and consulted a variety of library and manga reviewing resources. This series has been well reviewed, however, the content is noted as being appropriate for ages 16+. EPL's teen collections are aimed at youth 12-16 years of age. As such, EPL will be retaining the series in our collections but moving them to the Adult Graphic Novel collection.	EPL will be retaining the series in our collections but moving them to the Adult Graphic Novel collection.
September 1, 2016	Book: <i>Blankets</i> by Craig Thompson	Mature content the novel contains and the fact that it is placed in the teen graphic novel collection.	The librarian responsible for Youth Collections has reviewed the title and consulted a variety of library reviewing resources. As you indicated in your reconsideration request, <i>Blankets</i> has received many awards and has been heralded as a work of great value and importance. That being said, the audience is generally indicated as adults or mature teens; as such, EPL will be moving <i>Blankets</i> to the adult graphic novel collection	EPL will be moving <i>Blankets</i> to the adult graphic novel collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
November 7, 2016	Book: <i>Ma soeur veut un zizi</i> by Fabrice Boulanger	Requested that the book circulate with a warning on the book as it is a children's book that deals with reproduction and human sexuality	Books which deal with reproduction and human sexuality are often the subject of valid concern for parents like yourself. Parents are concerned that children receive not only correct information, but also information presented according to their wishes and beliefs. However, there are as many ideas about what constitutes appropriate information for children as there are families. While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it is the policy of the Library to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to.	"In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will not be adding a warning label to this book."
December 2, 2016	DVD: <i>Me before you</i>	Concern about the lack of a warning regarding content dealing with euthanasia	This movie title has a rating of PG-13 for "thematic elements and some suggestive material" which is indicated on the back of the DVD container and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue.	"In keeping with the above, [CFL Statement on Intellectual Freedom and Libraries] EPL will be retaining the movie Me before you without a warning label about its content."

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
February 28, 2017	Book: <i>Debbie Doesn't Do It Anymore</i> by Walter Mosley	Content is sexually explicit and would like to have a warning on the book indicating this, as well as requiring this to be checked out to customers over 18 only.	I acknowledge your response to this book. The title does fall within the Edmonton Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in the collection for adults. The policy of the Library is to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. The inclusion of this book in the adult fiction collection alerts customers that the content is intended for adults. We do not place warning labels on our material.	In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will not be adding any explicit warning to this material.
March 3, 2017	DVD: <i>Black's Game</i>	Requested the DVD be removed from the shelves due to content including criminal elements "shows step by step how to be a criminal", rape, and nudity.	The Library's Material Selection Policy mandates the purchase of library materials taking into account the diverse interests of Edmontonians including those that may be controversial to some. This movie is rated R for "strong sexuality, some graphic nudity, brutal violence..." which is indicated on the back of the DVD container and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. The Library's mandate is to supply a wide range of materials, in accordance with the Canadian Federation of Library Associations Statement on Intellectual Freedom and Libraries.	"In keeping with our adherence to this Statement and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will be retaining the movie Black's Game in its collection."

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
April 17, 2017	DVD: <i>The Handmaiden</i>	Content is sexually explicit and concerned it may be picked up by a child as it does not have a rating noted.	You expressed concern over the explicit sexual nature of this movie and that it should not be accessible to children. Although this film is not rated by the producer it is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library. Edmonton Public Library provides all customers with access to all of our collections, with the expectation that parents and guardians take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is acknowledged by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.	The Library's mandate is to supply a wide range of materials, in accordance with the Canadian Federation of Library Associations Statement on Intellectual Freedom and Libraries. In keeping with this statement and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will be retaining the movie <i>The Handmaiden</i> in its collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
August 30, 2017	Book: <i>Bullied Kids Speak Out</i> by Jodee Blanco	Not appropriate for Children's area, should be in teen.	The librarian responsible for Youth Collections has reviewed the title and consulted a variety of library reviewing resources. This resource is well reviewed and addresses an important concern for a variety of ages. That being said, the audience is generally indicated to be grades nine to 12; as such, EPL will be moving Bullied Kids Speak Out to the teen nonfiction collection.	EPL will be moving Bullied Kids Speak Out to the teen nonfiction collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 23, 2018	Book: <i>Everybunny Dance!</i> By Ellie Sandall	The theme of this book is anti-individual, anti-evolution and pro-conformist and one will learn nothing about animals in nature.	<p>The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted various library materials reviewing journals for additional feedback. This title is positively reviewed in all reviewing sources consulted, noting it is “an easy choice for storytime in any early childhood setting” (School Library Journal) and “Ideal to share with preschoolers, it promotes discussion about emotions, empathy and forming new friendships” (UK Booktrust). This title contains many hallmarks of an excellent book for a preschool audience including rhyme, rhythm, visual cues, and engaging page design.</p> <p>While your specific concern of the title being anti-individual and pro-conformist was not addressed in any of the reviews consulted, the general consensus is that <i>Everybunny Dance!</i> highlights a variety of engaging activities for a group of diversely portrayed bunnies as well as their joy at unexpectedly including a fox in their play. Additionally, this title is considered a fiction title, aimed at preschool age children (up to five years of age) and is not intended to impart factual information.</p>	EPL will maintain this title in the collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 16, 2018	Book: <i>The Boy at the Top of the Mountain</i> By John Boyne	Graphic description of sexual assault not appropriate for 8-12 year olds and should be moved to teen.	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted a variety of library reviewing resources. While the reviewing resources indicate that the book is written at a grade five or six reading level, most note disturbing content and an expectation that a prior understanding of WW II and the consequences of the Nazi regime is essential to managing the content of this work. The majority of reviewing resources suggest that this title should be in a teen collection.	EPL will be moving this item to the teen collection
February 13, 2019	Book: <i>Outside In</i> by Sarah Ellis	The language and content were not appropriate for young children.	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted a variety of library reviewing resources. All reviews consulted, as well as the publisher of this title, recommend that <i>Outside In</i> is appropriate for ages 10 to 13 or grade 5 and up. These recommendations indicate that this title is correctly classified in the Juvenile Fiction collection which includes titles for grades 2 to 6.	EPL has decided to maintain this title in the Juvenile Fiction collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
May 4, 2019	Book: <i>Soap Making</i> by Sarah Ade	The book contains instructions for mixing lye and water that are incorrect and could cause a serious injury. Request to remove this item from our collection.	Upon further investigation, we have determined that this is true. We have consulted an organic chemist and have verified that when diluting a strong base or acid (lye is solid sodium hydroxide, which is a strong base), the correct procedure is to add the acid or base to the water. If performed incorrectly, significant heat can be generated, causing the water (and acid/base) to spatter and risk a temperature or acid burn.	We strive to ensure that our collection is accurate and provides the most reliable information for our customers. As we have other titles on soap-making already available in the collection, we have made the decision to remove this title from the Library's collection.
May 21, 2019	Book: <i>Archie Vs Predator</i> by Alex de Campi	Concerned over the content, specifically, amount of violence in the illustrations.	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted various reviewing sources to ensure a thorough examination of the work. This title is positively reviewed in all sources consulted. However, the publisher and all reviewing sources reference this title as appropriate for ages 14+, as well as for teen readers. I would agree that this title is not appropriate for ages 10 and 8.	EPL has classified this title in the Teen graphic novel collection, indicating that the intended audience is ages 13 and above. EPL will be maintaining the title in the Teen graphic novel collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 11, 2019	Book: <i>Neon in Daylight</i> by Hermione Hoby	Content needs censoring, “raunchy” material.	While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it does fall within the Edmonton Public Library’s guidelines for inclusion in the collection for adults. EPL does expect parents and caregivers to guide the reading choices of young readers. The inclusion of this book in the adult fiction collection alerts all customers to the fact that the content is not intended for children.	In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, EPL has decided to maintain this title in the Adult Fiction Collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 21, 2020	Book: <i>Lines of Fire</i> by Ralph Peters	Concerned over the discussion of ethnic cleansing. Believes that the author is not condemning it and says its “better than genocide.”	<p>The librarian responsible for the adult nonfiction collection has reviewed the title and consulted a variety of library reviewing resources. As a collection of previously published essays and articles on military strategy, <i>Lines of Fire</i> received limited reviews, however, <i>the Better than Genocide essay</i> was originally published in 2007 in the <i>National Review</i>, a conservative opinion magazine in the United States that has been in publication since 1955. The essay at no point advocates for ethnic cleansing, and Peters states:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">It cannot be stressed too often or too forcefully that ethnic cleansing is a crime against humanity that cannot be excused. The purpose of this essay is to try to understand it – not to condone it – and to consider the implications for our military and diplomatic missions abroad. (p. 366)</p> <p>While controversial, Peters’ argument that in cases where ethnic cleansing <i>cannot be prevented</i>, it is preferable to allowing situations to escalate to the point of genocide, does not violate the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.</p>	In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection that reflects varying points of view, the Library will not be removing this title from the collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 6, 2020	Book: <i>The Innocent Malice</i> by Masaki Hiramatsu	Concerned with the sexual nature of the book and does not think the content should be included in the children's section.	The Librarian responsible for Youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted available reviews to ensure a thorough examination the work. This title is part of a larger story arc and is very popular with readers of manga, however, the publisher rates this title as OT: Older Teen which EPL normally classifies as an adult title. For these reasons, EPL will maintain this title in the collection but it will be moved to the Adult graphic novels collection.	For these reasons, EPL will maintain this title in the collection but it will be moved to the Adult graphic novels collection

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
March 8, 2021	Book: Archie vs Predator by Alex de Campi	Concerned that the comic is not appropriate for children and should be removed from the collection.	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted various reviewing sources to ensure a thorough examination of the work. This title is positively reviewed in all sources consulted. However, the publisher and all reviewing sources reference this title as appropriate for teen readers, ages 14 and up and is not suitable for younger children, who are the typical audience of Archie comics.	EPL has classified this title in the Teen graphic novel collection, indicating that the intended audience is ages 13 and above. For this reason, EPL will be maintaining the title, <i>Archie vs Predator</i> , in the Teen graphic novel collection. We recognize that this is not a traditional representation of the Archie comic character and as such, have classified it so that it is shelved away from the Children's graphic novel section.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
July 13, 2021	DVD: <i>Angel</i> by Joss Whedon & David Greenwait	Concerned that the content of the DVD is too violent and shows demonic depictions.	The librarian responsible for youth collections has reviewed the title and consulted various reviewing sources to ensure a thorough examination of the work. This title is positively reviewed in all sources consulted and has won several awards. Reviews indicate that this series of shows includes vampires as well some blood and gore but has “the ingredients for a successful TV drama”. <i>Angel</i> is rated for ages 14+ by the Motion Picture Association of America and for ages 13+ by Common Sense Media. These ratings place this title in the Teen collection, where EPL has it classified at this time.	EPL recognizes that many customers find <i>Angel</i> and its related show, <i>Buffy the Vampire Slayer</i> , as well as the graphic novel series that the TV shows are based off, engaging and diverting entertainment. For this reason, as well as the positive reviews garnered by the series, EPL will be maintaining the title <i>Angel</i> in our Teen DVD collection.
October 1, 2021	Book: al-Ṭibbal-Ṭibb, Bookal-khalāyā al-jidh‘īyah, al-jīnāt wa-al-ash‘ah al-khāriqah by Anne Rooney	Concerned that the content within the book is too advanced for children. It has a lot of medical terminology in arabic that children won’t understand.	The Associate Manager of Collections Management and Access who oversees the cataloging of our collections has reviewed the titles and sought the expertise of an Arabic speaker to ensure a thorough examination of the works. It has been determined that this book is not suitable for the children’s collection.	This book will be reclassified to the Adult Collection.

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 1, 2021	<p>Book: Taqsim ala watr munfarid Taqsim ala watr munfarid hīna nará wa-nuqra wa-naktub by Labbas, Jūzif Ṭāniyūs</p>	<p>Concerned that the content within the book is too advanced for children discusses poetry with a lot of difficult words in Arabic.</p>	<p>The Associate Manager of Collections Management and Access who oversees the cataloging of our collections has reviewed the titles and sought the expertise of an Arabic speaker to ensure a thorough examination of the works. It has been determined that this book is not suitable for the children’s collection.</p>	<p>This book will be reclassified to the Adult Collection.</p>
October 1, 2021	<p>Book: al-Ta’līm min al-mahdal-Ta’līm min al-mahd, Bookal-istifādah min waqt la’ib al-ṭifl fi al-ta’līm ghayr al-mubāshir by Ṣiddīq, Fathīyah Maḥmūd</p>	<p>Concerned that the content within the book is meant for parents rather than children. It discusses parenting instructions for children.</p>	<p>The Associate Manager of Collections Management and Access who oversees the cataloging of our collections has reviewed the titles and sought the expertise of an Arabic speaker to ensure a thorough examination of the works. It has been determined that this book is not suitable for the children’s collection.</p>	<p>This book will be reclassified to the Adult Collection.</p>

Challenged Materials

Date of Complaint	Title/Author	Nature of Complaint	Response/Rationale	Decision
October 16, 2021	Book: Halloween Surprise by Corinne Demas	Concerned that the book contains a culturally derogatory word “gypsy” and there is no discussion around why it’s not an acceptable word. Does not want children to read the book thinking it’s okay to use this word.	EPL does recognize that the term gypsy is considered an inappropriate descriptor for the Romani people and that these terms should be used with care and with an awareness of their impact in current speech. We are also cautious of dismissing works from our collection that include out-dated terms or illustrations, as this risks the loss of valuable content that may be found in the work despite containing outmoded elements. This approach is in line with EPL’s adherence to the Canadian Federation of Library Associations’ Statement on Intellectual Freedom that libraries provide access to the widest possible variety of expressive content.	This book will remain in EPL’s collection.